

**INFORMATIONAL REPORT ON FREQUENCY OF CITINGS
OF ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED
DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS IN DENTAL ANESTHESIOLOGY**

Background: Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology were approved by the Commission on Dental Accreditation at its January 25, 2007 meeting for immediate implementation. Significant revisions were made to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology in 2012 and 2015. Since January 25, 2007, 28 Dental Anesthesiology site visits have been conducted by visiting committees of the Commission utilizing the January 2007 Standards. At the time of this report, the Standards include 61 “must” statements addressing 107 required areas of compliance. This report presents the number of times areas of non-compliance were cited by visiting committees conducting site visits January 25, 2007 through October 31, 2021. If special (focused or comprehensive), pre-enrollment, or pre-graduation site visits were conducted during this period, citings from those visits are also included.

Analysis: The distribution of citings is presented in **Appendix 1**. An analysis of the site visit reports shows that a total of 10 citings of non-compliance were noted in the reports. Of these, 4 were related to Standard 1 – Institutional and Program Effectiveness; two (2) were related to Standard 2 – Educational Program; three (3) were related to Standard 3 – Faculty and Staff; and one (1) was related to Standard 4 – Educational Support Services. No (0) citations were made in Standard 5 – Facilities and Resources or 6 – Research. Analysis of the data indicates that the most frequently cited Standard is Standard 1-5, written agreements, with four (4) citations.

Due to the limited number of citings, a trend in the data cannot be identified.

Summary: The Commission will continue to receive reports annually summarizing the updated data on the frequency of citings of individual Standards.

Recommendation: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

**ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED GENERAL DENTISTRY
 EDUCATION PROGRAMS IN DENTAL ANESTHESIOLOGY
 Frequency of Citings Based on Required Areas of Compliance**

Total Number of Programs Evaluated = 28
 January 2007 through October 2021

Standard 1 – Institutional and Program Effectiveness (18 Required Areas of Compliance)

Non-Compliance Citings	Accreditation Standard	Required Areas of Compliance
4	1-5	All arrangements with co-sponsoring or affiliated institutions must be formalized by means of written agreements that clearly define the roles and responsibilities of each institution involved.

Standard 2 – Educational Program (61 Required Areas of Compliance)

Non-Compliance Citings	Accreditation Standard	Required Areas of Compliance
1	2-3	The program must have a written curriculum plan including structured didactic instruction and clinical experience designed to achieve the program’s written competency requirements.
	2-19	The program’s resident evaluation system must assure that, through the director and faculty, each program: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a) Periodically, but at least twice annually, evaluates and documents the resident’s progress towards achieving the program’s competency and proficiency requirements and minimum anesthesia case requirements using appropriate written criteria and procedures; b) Provides residents with an assessment of their performance after each evaluation; where deficiencies are noted, corrective actions must be taken; and c) Maintains a personal record of evaluation for each resident which is accessible to the resident and available for review during site visits.

Standard 3 – Faculty and Staff (6 Required Areas of Compliance)

Non-Compliance Citings	Accreditation Standard	Required Areas of Compliance
1	3-2	The program director must be a dentist with two years formal training in anesthesiology that is consistent with or equivalent to the training program described in Standard 2 and have had at least three years of relevant experience following the formal training in anesthesiology. Dentists will also qualify to be program directors who, prior to implementation of these Standards, have completed an advanced training course in anesthesiology that satisfied the duration requirements set forth in Part 2 of the American Dental Association’s “Guidelines for Teaching the Comprehensive Control of Anxiety and Pain in Dentistry” at the time their training commenced.
1	3-2 (Revised 2/4/11)	The program director must have completed a two-year anesthesiology residency for dentists consistent with or equivalent to the training program described in Standard 2 and have had at least two years of recent additional continuous significant practice of general anesthesia. A one-year anesthesiology residency for dentists completed prior to July 1993 is acceptable provided that continuous significant practice of general anesthesia in the previous two years is documented.
1	3-3	The program must be staffed by faculty who are qualified by education and/or clinical experience in the curriculum areas for which they are responsible and have collective competence in all areas of dental anesthesiology included in the program.

Standard 4 – Educational Support Services (11 Required Areas of Compliance)

Non-Compliance Citings	Accreditation Standard	Required Areas of Compliance
1	4-5 (previously 4-4)	The program’s description of the educational experience to be provided must be available to program applicants and include: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) A description of the educational experience to be providedb) A list of competencies and proficiencies of residency trainingc) A description of the nature of assignments to other departments or institutions.

Standard 5 – Facilities and Resources (10 Required Areas of Compliance)

Standard 6 – Research (1 Required Area of Compliance)

**CONSIDERATION OF PROPOSED REVISION OF STANDARD 1-1 OF THE
ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION
PROGRAMS IN DENTAL ANESTHESIOLOGY RELATED TO INSTITUTIONAL
ACCREDITATION**

Background: At its Winter 2021 meeting, the Commission on Dental Accreditation considered the report of the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy Review and learned that the language used by the United States Department of Education (USDE) related to a parent institution's accreditation changed from "regional" accreditation to "institutional" accreditation, as noted in regulation §602.3 (Definitions). In addition, the Commission learned the USDE's sole reference to "institutional accreditation" could create confusion when identifying the institutional accreditors that have USDE recognition authority to oversee institutions at the post-secondary, doctoral, and post-doctoral levels. The concern is that the change in USDE language could result in questions regarding the level of degree-granting authority that the institution has and its institutional accreditor's USDE recognition. Therefore, the Commission directed all Review Committees to review and revise their Accreditation Standards, as applicable, to align with USDE terminology related to "institutional accreditation" and to ensure the Accreditation Standards clearly document the appropriate type of accreditor for the discipline, with a report to the Commission's Summer 2021 meeting.

At its Summer 2021 meeting, the Review Committee on Advanced Education in General Dentistry, General Practice Residency, Dental Anesthesiology, Oral Medicine, and Orofacial Pain (AGDOO RC) reviewed the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Education in General Dentistry, General Practice Residency, Dental Anesthesiology, Oral Medicine and Orofacial Pain to ensure alignment with USDE terminology related to "institutional accreditation" and to ensure the Accreditation Standards clearly document the appropriate type of accreditor for the discipline. The AGDOO RC confirmed the Accreditation Standards for each discipline do not reference "regional" or "institutional accreditor."

Following further review, the AGDOO RC believed Standard 1-1 of the Accreditation Standards of the disciplines under its purview appropriately document the type of accreditor required for programs sponsored by hospitals or health care organizations through requiring sponsoring institution accreditation by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS) and that the Standards appropriately document the sponsoring institution accreditation requirement for US military programs through demonstration of successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection criteria or accreditation by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). However, the AGDOO RC believed the institutional accreditation requirement by sponsoring institutions that are not a hospital or health care organization or US military should be revised to ensure they clearly document the appropriate type of accreditor for each discipline.

In addition, the AGDOO RC believed the examples of evidence for Standard 1-1 of each discipline under its purview should also be revised to further support and clarify the requirements of Standard 1-1 and that the proposed revisions be circulated to the communities of interest for review and comment for a period of one year, with hearings conducted in conjunction with the October 2021 American Dental Association (ADA) Annual Meeting and the March 2022 American Dental Education Association (ADEA) Annual Session. Comments will be reviewed at the Summer 2022 meetings of the new Review Committee on Dental Anesthesiology (DENTANES RC) and the Commission.

As directed by the Commission, the proposed revisions to Standard 1-1 of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology (**Appendix 1**) were circulated for comment through June 1, 2022. No (0) comments were received at the ADA Virtual Hearing and no (0) comments were received at the ADEA Virtual Hearing. The Commission office received one (1) written comment prior to the June 1, 2022 deadline (**Appendix 2**).

It should be noted that at the Winter 2022 Commission meeting, the Commission directed the formation of an Ad Hoc Committee to consider the changing landscape of healthcare delivery centers that may sponsor advanced dental education programs.

Summary: At this meeting, the Dental Anesthesiology Review Committee and the Commission are asked to consider the proposed revision to Standard 1-1 of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology (**Appendix 1**) and all of the comments received prior to the June 1, 2022 deadline (**Appendix 2**). If further revisions are proposed, the Commission may wish to circulate the proposed changes to the communities of interest for an additional comment period. Alternately, if the proposed revision is adopted, the Commission may wish to consider an implementation date. The DENTANES RC may also consider postponing further consideration of this proposed revision until the work of the Ad Hoc Committee to study the changing landscape of healthcare delivery centers that may sponsor advanced dental education programs is completed.

Recommendation:

Commission on Dental Accreditation

At its Summer 2021 meeting, the Commission directed that the proposed revisions to Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology be distributed to the appropriate communities of interest for review and comment, with comment due June 1, 2022, for review at the Summer 2022 Commission meeting.

Written comments will only be accepted through the Commission's Electronic Comment Submission Portal at this link:

https://surveys.ada.org/jfe/form/SV_3t61Uvg45BCi1Df

Additions are Underlined;
~~Strikethroughs~~ indicate Deletions

Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology

STANDARD 1 – INSTITUTIONAL AND PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS

1-1 The program **must** be sponsored or co-sponsored by either a United States-based hospital, or educational institution or health care organization that is affiliated with an accredited hospital. Each sponsoring and co-sponsoring institution **must** be accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS).

United States military programs not sponsored or co-sponsored by military medical treatment facilities, United States-based educational institutions, hospitals or health care organizations accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS) **must** demonstrate successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection criteria.

Advanced dental education programs **must** be sponsored by institutions which are properly chartered and licensed to operate and offer instruction leading to postdoctoral degrees, diplomas and/or certificates with recognized education validity.

Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:

Accreditation certificate or current official listing of accredited institutions from a USDE-recognized accreditation organization with appropriate recognition authority

Evidence of successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection criteria, for US military programs, as noted in Standard 1-1

Evidence of institutional accreditation from an accreditation organization currently recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). For example, recognized accreditation organizations may include: Accreditation Association for Ambulatory Health Care (AAAHC); Accreditation Commission for Health Care, Inc. (ACHC); American Association for Accreditation of Ambulatory Surgery Facilities (AAAASF); American Osteopathic Association Healthcare Facilities Accreditation Program (AOA/HFAP); Center for Improvement in Healthcare Quality (CIHQ); Community Health Accreditation Program (CHAP); DNV GL-Healthcare (DNV GL); National Dialysis Accreditation Commission (NDAC); The Compliance Team (TCT); The Joint Commission (JC).

From: [The Commission on Dental Accreditation](#)
To: [Soeldner, Peggy](#)
Subject: Comments on Proposed Revision of Standards for Dental Anesthesiology Programs
Date: Wednesday, February 9, 2022 2:20:07 PM

The Commission on Dental Accreditation has received your comment(s). Below, please find a copy of your submission.

Please do not respond to this email; reply has been disabled. Thank you.

Recipient Data:

Time Finished: 2022-02-09 13:20:02 MST

IP: 73.73.145.61

ResponseID: R_1QavoPl4tTKfN7e

Link to View Results: [Click Here](#)

URL to View Results: https://surveys.ada.org/CP/Report.php?SID=SV_6wZigrrcFOpF0I5&R=R_1QavoPl4tTKfN7e

Response Summary:

Please complete the requested information.

First Name Annette

Last Name Puzan

Email puzana@ada.org

Title Manger, Dental Education & Licensure

Please select one of the following options that best describes you or your organization:

Other (Please specify) -- Council on Dental Education and Licensure (CDEL)

Is this an official comment from your organization?

Yes. Please enter the name of your organization below. -- Council on Dental Education and Licensure (CDEL)

Enter the Standard number(s), page(s) and line(s) to which you would like to comment.

Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology

Do you agree with the proposed revision?

Agree

Enter your comment. Type or copy and paste in the text box below.

The following comment is being submitted on behalf of Dr. Thomas-Moses, chair, and the members of the ADA Council on Dental Education and Licensure:

A duty of the ADA Council on Dental Education and Licensure is to act as the agency of the Association in matters related to the accreditation of dental, advanced dental and allied dental education programs. Accordingly, at its January 2022 meeting, Council members considered and supported the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology. The Council appreciates the opportunity to

submit comment on this important document.

Do you have additional comment?

I have NO additional comment and ready to submit.

CONSIDERATION OF THE POLICY ON ENROLLMENT INCREASES IN ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS

Background: At its Winter 2022 meeting, through consideration of proposed revisions to miscellaneous policies, including the Policy on Enrollment Increases in Advanced Dental Education Programs (**Appendix 1**), the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy Review learned that advanced dental education disciplines in advanced education in general dentistry, general practice residency, dental anesthesiology, oral medicine, and orofacial pain do not have authorized enrollment. Instead, these disciplines follow a process outlined in the Policy on Enrollment Increases in Advanced Dental Education Programs for determining when and how an increase in enrollment must be reported to CODA. The Standing Committee also noted the process to determine when an increase is reported includes consideration of the enrollment at the time of the last site visit and any prior approval of an increase in enrollment and a preliminary review by the discipline-specific review committee chair to determine the requirement for review and approval by the full Commission. The Standing Committee learned that the complexity of this process often causes confusion and uncertainty in when and how to report an enrollment increase. Following discussion, the Standing Committee believed input from the affected discipline-specific review committees is warranted and recommended that the Commission direct the Review Committees on Postdoctoral General Dentistry, Dental Anesthesiology, Oral Medicine and Orofacial Pain review the Policy on Enrollment Increases in Advanced Dental Education Programs and consider the implementation of authorized enrollment for programs in these disciplines for consideration at the Winter 2023 meeting of the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy Review and the Commission. At its Winter 2022 meeting, the Commission concurred.

Summary: At this meeting, the Dental Anesthesiology Review Committee (DENTANES RC) is requested to review the Policy on Enrollment Increases in Advanced Dental Education Programs (**Appendix 1**) and consider the implementation of authorized enrollment for advanced dental education programs in dental anesthesiology with a report to the Winter 2023 meeting of the Standing Committee on Documentation and Policy Review and the Commission.

Recommendation:

Consideration of the Policy on Enrollment Increases
In Advanced Dental Education Programs
DENTANES RC
CODA Summer 2022

L. POLICY ON ENROLLMENT INCREASES IN ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS

An advanced dental education program considering or planning an enrollment increase, or any other substantive change, should notify the Commission early in the program's planning. Such notification will provide an opportunity for the program to seek consultation from Commission staff regarding the potential effect of the proposed change on the accreditation status and the procedures to be followed.

The following advanced dental education disciplines have authorized total complement enrollment: dental public health, endodontics, oral and maxillofacial pathology, oral and maxillofacial radiology, oral and maxillofacial surgery (per year enrollment is authorized), orthodontics and dentofacial orthopedics, pediatric dentistry, periodontics, and prosthodontics. Programs with authorized enrollment must use the discipline-specific Guidelines to request and obtain approval for an increase in enrollment prior to implementing the increase.

The following advanced dental education disciplines do not have authorized enrollment: advanced education in general dentistry, general practice residency, dental anesthesiology, oral medicine, and orofacial pain. However, approval of an increase in enrollment in these advanced dental education programs must be reported to the Commission if the program's total enrollment increases beyond the enrollment at the last site visit or prior approval of enrollment increase. Programs must use the discipline-specific Guidelines to request an increase in enrollment prior to implementing the increase. Upon submission of the program change report, a substantial increase in program enrollment as determined by preliminary review by the discipline-specific Review Committee Chair, will require prior approval by CODA.

A request for an increase in enrollment with all supporting documentation must be submitted in writing to the Commission by **May 1 or November 1**. A program must receive Commission approval for an increase in enrollment prior to publishing or announcing the additional positions or accepting additional students/residents. Failure to comply with this policy will jeopardize the program's accreditation status, up to and including withdrawal of accreditation.

Requests for *retroactive permanent* increases in enrollment will not be considered. The Commission may consider retroactive temporary enrollment increases due to special circumstances on a case-by-case basis, including, but not limited to:

- Student/Resident extending program length due to illness, parental leave, incomplete projects/clinical assignments, or concurrent enrollment in another program;
- Unexpected loss of an enrollee and need to maintain balance of manpower needs;
- Urgent manpower needs demanded by U.S. armed forces; and
- Natural disasters.

If a program has enrolled beyond the approved number of students/residents without prior approval by the Commission, the Commission may or may not retroactively approve the enrollment increase without a special focused site visit at the program's expense.

If the focused visit determines that the program does not have the resources to support the additional student(s)/resident(s), the program will be placed on "intent to withdraw" status and no additional student(s)/resident(s) beyond the previously approved number may be admitted to the program until the deficiencies have been rectified and approved by the Commission. Student(s)/Resident(s) who have already been formally accepted or enrolled in the program will be allowed to continue.