

REPORT OF THE REVIEW COMMITTEE ON PREDOCTORAL DENTAL EDUCATION TO THE COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION

Committee Chair: Dr. Cataldo Leone. Committee Members: Mr. Drew Christianson, Dr. Sillas Duarte (Virtual), Dr. Kevin Haubrick, Ms. Wilhemina Leeuw, Dr. Ana Karina Mascarenhas (Virtual), Dr. Thomas McConnell, Dr. Deborah Weisfuse-Lipner (Virtual), and Dr. Linda Wells. Guests (Open Session Only, Virtual): Dr. Sheila Brear, chief learning officer, American Dental Education Association and Dr. JoAnn Gurenlian, director, Education, Research & Advocacy, American Dental Hygienists' Association attended the policy portion of the meeting. Staff Members: Ms. Kelly Stapleton, manager, Predoctoral Dental Education, Ms. Attiyya Muhammad, senior project assistant, Dr. Sherin Took, senior director, CODA, and Ms. Samara Schwartz, senior associate general counsel, CODA. Ms. Peggy Soeldner, manager, Advanced Dental Education, CODA attended a portion of the meeting. The meeting of the Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC) was held on January 8 – 9, 2024 at the ADA Headquarters, Chicago, Illinois and via a virtual meeting.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO PREDOCTORAL DENTAL EDUCATION

Informational Report on Predoctoral Dental Education Programs Annual Survey

Curriculum Data (p. 100): The Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC) noted that data of the Annual Survey Curriculum section for dental education is reviewed as an informational report, when the materials are available following data collection and analysis. All survey data is considered confidential at the programmatic level.

At the Winter 2024 meeting, the PREDOC RC considered the most recent data for the Curriculum Section of the Commission's Annual Survey for dental education, which was conducted in August 2023. Aggregate data of the most recent Curriculum Section was provided for the Predoctoral Dental Education RC as an informational report (**Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 100**). Additionally, the PREDOC Review Committee discussed whether revisions were warranted to the Curriculum Section of its dental education Annual Survey for the next cycle and determined that no revisions are warranted at this time.

Recommendation: This report is information in nature and no action is required.

Informational Report on Dental Therapy Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Data (p. 101): The Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC) noted that data of the Annual Survey Curriculum section for dental therapy is reviewed as an informational report, when the materials are available following data collection and analysis. All survey data is considered confidential at the programmatic level.

At the Winter 2024 meeting, the PREDOC RC considered the most recent Curriculum Section of the Commission's Annual Survey for dental therapy, conducted in August 2023. Aggregate data

was not available since a limited number (three or less) programs are accredited by the Commission. Once there are four (4) or more Dental Therapy Education Programs, the aggregate data of the Curriculum Section of the Commission's Annual Survey for dental therapy will be made available. Additionally, the PREDOC Review Committee discussed whether revisions were warranted to the Curriculum Section of its dental therapy Annual Survey for the next cycle and determined that no revisions are warranted at this time.

Recommendation: This report is information in nature and no action is required.

Consideration of Proposed Revisions to Improve Diversity in Dental and Dental Related Education Programs (p. 102): On December 1, 2023, the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) received a letter from The National Coalition of Dentists for Health Equity (TNCDHE). The request is found in **Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 102**. In its letter, TNCDHE provides short-term and long-term suggestions to CODA to improve diversity in all academic dental, allied dental, and advanced dental education programs.

At its Winter 2024 meeting, the Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC) reviewed the letter from The National Coalition of Dentists for Health Equity (TNCDHE). The PREDOC RC noted this letter is a follow-up to a previous request the PREDOC RC considered at the Winter 2023 Commission meetings regarding TNCDHE's suggested revisions to Standards 1-3, 1-4, and 4-4 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs. At the Winter 2023 meetings, PREDOC RC recommended, and the Commission concurred, that the Ad Hoc Committee to Review Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs be directed to consider the proposed revisions to Standards 1-3, 1-4, and 4-4 submitted by TNCDHE, with a future report to the Review Committee and Commission.

The PREDOC RC noted TNCDHE's current letter recommended short- and long-term suggestions for the Commission to consider and noted the letter expanded its suggestions to include all academic dental, advanced dental, and allied dental education programs. Following discussion, the Committee concluded that the requests in the letter should be forwarded to the Ad Hoc Committee to Review Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs for further consideration.

Recommendation: It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation direct the Ad Hoc Committee to Review Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs to consider the proposed short-term and long-term suggestions submitted by The National Coalition of Dentists for Health Equity related to improving diversity, with a future report to the Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education and Commission.

Consideration of Faculty to Student Ratios in Accreditation Standards (p. 103): At its Winter 2023 meeting, the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) considered a letter from 17 state dental associations related to workforce shortages in dental assisting and dental hygiene

education programs. The Commission discussed the letter and directed that a formal letter be sent to the state dental associations requesting additional information on the request, and that an Ad Hoc Committee be established to consider ratios within the Commission's Accreditation Standards. The Ad Hoc Committee conducted an extensive review of the issues surrounding the state dental associations' request. Following review of faculty to student ratios in Accreditation Standards, the Ad Hoc Committee submitted its report (**Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 103**), to the Commission for consideration at its Summer 2023 meeting.

In Summer 2023, the Commission reviewed the report and recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee on Faculty to Student Ratios in Accreditation Standards. Following review, the Commission concurred with the recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee and directed that the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Faculty to Student Ratios in Accreditation Standards be provided to the Review Committees that oversee dental assisting, dental hygiene, dental laboratory technology, and dental therapy education for further consideration and review, including determination if revisions of Accreditation Standards are warranted, with a report to the Commission in Winter 2024. The Commission also directed that there be no development of a policy or process for rationale that must be followed when revising Accreditation Standards related to faculty to student ratios, and that a copy of the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Faculty to Student Ratios in Accreditation Standards be provided to the state dental associations.

At its Winter 2024 meeting, the Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC) reviewed the report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Faculty to Student Ratios in Accreditation Standards. The PREDOC RC reviewed Standard 3-5 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs and believed that no changes are needed to the current faculty-to-student ratios as written in the Standards. The PREDOC RC recognized the one-to-six ratio for dental therapy education programs is consistent with the request from the state dental associations. The Committee believed the current ratios for dental therapy programs do not hinder programs from providing a quality education program. Further, the number of enrolled students in a dental therapy program is much less than enrollment in dental hygiene programs; therefore, the ratio and required number of faculty in dental therapy programs is not generally a concern. The PREDOC RC discussed that the Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs have yet to go through a validity and reliability study to provide specific dental therapy program data to further determine if changes to the current ratio are warranted in the future. The first validity and reliability study for the Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs will be conducted in 2025, since the first dental therapy program was accredited by the Commission in 2020.

The PREDOC RC also recognized that the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs currently has a different faculty-to-student ratio from other Accreditation Standards for allied dental education programs, which may be perceived as inconsistent for institutions that sponsor multiple allied dental education programs. However, the PREDOC RC recognized the request to review faculty-to-student ratios from the state dental associations provided rationale to address work force shortages. The PREDOC RC believed that there are

many factors that may contribute to work force shortages and dental education programs have many options, such as increasing enrollment and adding sites where educational activity occurs, to provide quality education within the requirements of the current discipline-specific Accreditation Standards.

The PREDOC RC believed the Ad Hoc Committee on Faculty to Student Ratios in Accreditation Standards completed a thorough review of this topic. Following discussion, the PREDOC Review Committee concurred with the recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee and recommend no changes to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs.

Recommendation: It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation accept the report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Faculty to Student Ratios in Accreditation Standards and direct there be no revisions related to faculty-to-student ratios at this time within the Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs.

Report of the Standing Committee on International Accreditation (p. 104): The Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC) reviewed the report of the Standing Committee on International Accreditation. The Standing Committee considered the Instituto Tecnológico y de Estudios Superiores de Monterrey, Monterrey, Nuevo Leon, Mexico during its meeting on Wednesday, December 13, 2023. The Standing Committee on International Accreditation directed that a formal letter be sent to the program reviewed, as applicable, in accordance with the actions taken by the Committee.

Recommendation: This report is information in nature and no action is required.

NEW BUSINESS

Consideration of In-Person On-Site Work Expectations for Program Directors: The Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC) discussed the possibility of program directors working remotely and not in-person, on-site at one of the program's approved educational sites. The PREDOC RC recognizes the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) does not have a defined policy or requirement in some discipline-specific Accreditation Standards that stipulates the program director must be in-person, on-site to fulfill the duties as written in the Accreditation Standards. The expectation of in-person, on-site work may be implied through the Accreditation Standards, given the historical structure and expectations of dental education. However, the PREDOC RC believes that CODA should clearly define this expectation for future interpretation of program director qualifications in accordance with the discipline-specific Accreditation Standards.

Through a discussion, the PREDOC RC recognized that new technologies and an increasing remote workforce may allow program directors to complete some job tasks remotely. However, tasks such as supervision of faculty and some day-to-day job responsibilities would require the program director to be in-person, on-site at the program's approved educational sites.

Additionally, for programs that have multiple approved educational sites that may be geographically separated from the sponsoring institution, including those spread throughout an individual state or located in different states, it is not clearly defined how much time the program director should spend at each site for supervision over the day-to-day operations, as listed in the discipline-specific Accreditation Standards, or the requirement to delegate site supervision responsibilities.

The PREDOC RC noted some Accreditation Standards dictate the program director's qualifications and job assignments as "defined by the program" and others indicate specific requirements for site supervision. However, the PREDOC RC believes CODA may need to investigate and review the in-person, on-site work expectations for program directors to determine if changes are needed to the Accreditation Standards for dental education, advanced dental education, and allied dental education programs.

Recommendation: It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation direct an Ad Hoc or Standing Committee to investigate in-person, on-site work expectations for program directors to determine if changes are needed in the discipline-specific Accreditation Standards for dental education, advanced dental education, and allied dental education programs.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATING TO MORE THAN ONE REVIEW COMMITTEE

Matters related to more than one review committee are included in a separate report.

CONSIDERATION OF SITE VISITOR APPOINTMENTS TO THE COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION IN THE AREA OF PREDOCTORAL DENTAL EDUCATION AND DENTAL THERAPY EDUCATION

The Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education considered site visitor appointments for 2024-2025. The Committee's recommendations on the appointments of individuals are included in a separate report.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO ACCREDITATION STATUS

Matters related to accreditation status of programs are included in a separate report.

Respectfully submitted,

Dr. Cataldo Leone
Chair, Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education