

## **REPORT OF THE REVIEW COMMITTEE ON DENTAL HYGIENE EDUCATION TO THE COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION**

Committee Chair: Dr. Susan Kass. Committee Members: Ms. Tami Grzesikowski, Ms. Carrie Hobbs, Dr. Lorie Holt, Dr. Tariq Javed, Ms. Betty Kabel, Dr. Barbara Krieg-Menning, Dr. Nancy Rosenthal, Ms. Laura Scully, Dr. Suzanne Thomas, and Dr. Sheila Vandembush. Guests (Open Session Only): Dr. JoAnn Gurenlian, director, Education and Research, American Dental Hygienists' Association, and Ms. Rebecca Stolberg, vice president, Allied Dental Education and Faculty Development, American Dental Education Association, attended the policy portion of the meeting. Staff Members: Dr. Sherin Took, director, Ms. Jamie Asher Hernandez, manager, Allied Dental Education, and Mr. Daniel Sloyan, senior project assistant, Allied Dental Education, CODA. Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA, attended a portion of the meeting. The meeting of the Review Committee on Dental Hygiene Education (DH RC) was held on July 11-12, 2022 and July 25, 2022 via a virtual meeting.

### **CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO DENTAL HYGIENE EDUCATION**

**Informational Report on Frequency of Citings of Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs (p. 400)**: The Review Committee on Dental Hygiene Education (DH RC) considered the annual report of the frequency of citings of Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs and noted the most frequently cited areas of non-compliance for site visits conducted between January 1, 2009 and October 31, 2021.

The data indicates that a total of 2,245 citings of non-compliance were made. Of these, 171 (7.6%) were related to Standard 1–Institutional Effectiveness; 1,147 (51.0%) were related to Standard 2–Educational Program; 405 (18.0%) were related to Standard 3–Administration, Faculty and Staff; 193 (8.5%) were related to Standard 4–Educational Support Services; 100 (4.4%) were related to Standard 5–Health and Safety Provisions; and 229 (10.2%) were related to Standard 6–Patient Care Services.

The most frequently cited areas of non-compliance are within Standard 2–Educational Program. The subsets of Standard 2-12 were cited most frequently and received a total of 272 citations; this Standard requires that graduate be competent in providing dental hygiene care for various patient types including patients with special needs. Citations within Standard 2-12 patient types were distributed as follows: child (53), adolescent (65), adult (38), geriatric (58), and special needs patients (58). Standard 2-7, which describes the course documentation components provided to students, was cited a total of 188 times. Within Standard 3–Administration, Faculty and Staff, Standard 3-7, a) requiring current knowledge of the specific subject(s) faculty are teaching, and b) requiring educational methodology for faculty, received 61 and 77 citations, respectively.

**Recommendation**: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

**Consideration of the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee to Review the Allied Dental**

**Education Biosketch (p. 401):** At its Winter 2022 meeting, the Commission on Dental Accreditation considered the Report of the Review Committee on Dental Hygiene Education (DH RC), which included a new business item related to the biosketch for allied dental education programs. Specifically, the DH RC discussed the Commission’s Allied Biosketch Template that is provided to dental hygiene education programs for use when reporting information on faculty, including changes in the program director. The DH RC noted that information is often incomplete and/or outdated, which results in questions pertaining to a program’s compliance with CODA’s Accreditation Standards related to faculty qualifications. It was also noted that the Teaching Schedule table within the biosketch should be reviewed to ensure current and complete program director and full-time faculty duties are clearly documented by programs. At its Winter 2022 meeting, the Commission directed the appointment of an Ad Hoc Committee of dental hygiene and dental assisting Review Committee members to review the Allied Biosketch Template, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2022.

At this meeting, the DH RC considered the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee to Review the Allied Dental Education Biosketch, including a proposed revised biosketch (**Appendix 2, Policy Report p. 401**). The DH RC believed that the proposed revised biosketch clearly outlines the required information to be submitted by program directors and faculty who teach within dental hygiene education programs. The Committee believed that the revised biosketch should be adopted by the Commission and implemented immediately, including implementation in the Dental Hygiene Self-Study Guide.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation direct adoption and immediate implementation of the proposed revised Allied Biosketch (**Appendix 2, Policy Report p. 401**) and inclusion in all applicable Commission documents including the Dental Hygiene Self-Study Guide.

**Consideration of Accreditation Standards Related to Institutional Accreditation (p. 402):**

The Dental Hygiene Education Review Committee (DH RC) considered the changes in the language used by the United States Department of Education (USDE) related to a parent institution’s accreditation changed from “regional” accreditation to “institutional” accreditation, as noted in regulation §602.3 (Definitions). It was noted that review of this topic occurred in Winter 2021, Summer 2021, and Winter 2022. Most recently, in Winter 2022, the Commission directed that the Review Committees on Dental Assisting, Dental Hygiene, Dental Laboratory Technology, and Predoctoral Dental Education review the Accreditation Standards within their purview and confirm the language and names of accrediting agencies included is accurate, complete and current, and to review and replace, where appropriate, regional/national accreditation with institutional accreditation, with a report to the Commission at its Summer 2022 meeting.

At this meeting, the DH RC reviewed Standard 1-6 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs, related to the institutional accreditation requirement for dental hygiene education programs that are accredited by the Commission. Following discussion, the DH RC believed that some institutional accreditors’ names should be updated in CODA’s

Accreditation Standards. The editorial changes in institutional accreditor names are noted below (Underline indicates Addition; ~~Strikethrough~~ indicates Deletion).

**1-6 Programs must be sponsored by institutions of higher education that are accredited by an institutional accrediting agency (i.e., a regional or appropriate\* national accrediting agency) recognized by the United States Department of Education for offering college-level programs.**

\* Agencies whose mission includes the accreditation of institutions offering allied health education programs.

**Intent:**

*Dental schools, four-year colleges and universities, community colleges, technical institutes, vocational schools, and private schools, which offer appropriate fiscal, facility, faculty and curriculum resources are considered appropriate settings for the program. The institution should offer appropriate fiscal, facility, faculty and curriculum resources to sponsor the dental hygiene educational program.*

**Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:**

- Accreditation (or candidate status) from a recognized institutional (regional or national) accrediting agency, for example:  
~~Commission on Higher Education~~, Middle States Commission on Higher Education~~Association of Colleges and Schools~~; ~~Commission on Institutions of Higher Education~~, New England Commission on Higher Education~~Association of Schools and Colleges~~; Commission on Technical and Career Institutions, New England Association of Schools and Colleges; Higher Learning Commission~~Commission on Institutions of Higher Education~~, North Central Association of Colleges and Schools; ~~Commission on Colleges~~, Northwest Association of Schools and Colleges ~~and Universities~~; ~~Commission on Colleges~~, Southern Association of Colleges and Schools, Commission on Colleges; WASC Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges, ~~Western Association of Schools and Colleges~~; ~~Accrediting Commission for WASC~~ Senior Colleges and University Commission~~Universities~~, ~~Western Association of Schools and Colleges~~; Accrediting Bureau of Health Education Schools; Accrediting Commission ~~of~~ for Career Schools and Colleges ~~of Technology~~; ~~Accrediting Commission of the~~ Distance Education Accrediting Commission~~and Training Council~~; The Council on Occupational Education; Accrediting Council for Independent Colleges and Schools

The DH RC also considered whether additional Accreditation Standards warrant revisions. Since the dental hygiene Standards cite both national and regional accreditors, the DH RC believed no other revisions were warranted at this time. Due to the editorial nature of the proposed revisions to Standard 1-6, the DH RC recommended that the Commission adopt and immediately implement the proposed revisions in all applicable Dental Hygiene Standards and related documents.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation adopt and direct immediate implementation of the proposed revisions, noted above, to

Standard 1-6 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs and all related documents.

**Consideration of Proposed Revisions to Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene**

**Education Programs (p. 403)**: At its Winter 2022 meeting, the Review Committee on Dental Hygiene Education (DH RC) and Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) reviewed the November 12, 2021 letter from Ms. Margaret Lemaster, dental hygiene program director, requesting that the Commission consider proposed revisions to Standards 2-14 and 3-7 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs. The proposed revision to Dental Hygiene Standard 3-7 (Standard 3-6 of the Accreditation Standards implemented July 1, 2022) suggested that the Commission require all full-time faculty to possess a master's degree or be in the process of obtaining a master's degree. Currently, Standard 3-6 requires that "*Full-time and part-time faculty of a dental hygiene program **must** possess a baccalaureate or higher degree. All part-time clinical and dental science laboratory faculty appointed prior to July 1, 2022 are exempt from this degree requirement.*" Following consideration of the proposed revision, the DH RC recommended proposed revision to Standards 2-14 and 3-6, which were considered by the Commission at its Winter 2022 meeting and returned to the Dental Hygiene Review Committee for further consideration at the request of the Dental Hygiene Commissioner since it was identified that the proposed revision to Standard 3-6 would exempt all full-time and part-time dental hygiene faculty from the degree requirement.

Subsequently, on April 27, 2022, the Commission received a request from Dr. Warren Gabaree, department head of dental programs, for review of Dental Hygiene Standard 3-6 of the Accreditation Standards to be implemented July 1, 2022 related to the qualifications of full-time faculty. Additionally, on May 19, 2022, the CODA received a letter from Mr. Bracken Killpack, executive director, Washington State Dental Association, on behalf of 16 state dental associations, to consider proposed revisions to allow programs to determine their faculty to student ratios (Standard 3-6; Standard 3-5 effective July 1, 2022) and to determine the qualifications necessary for clinical faculty (Standard 3-7; Standard 3-6 effective July 1, 2022) from the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs. The state dental associations believe that a severe shortage of dental hygienists could be addressed, in part, through changes to the above noted Standards. Following publication of the Commission's Summer 2022 policy on this matter, the Commission received (on June 27, 2022) a letter from the ADA's Council on Dental Education and Licensure (CDEL) requesting the Commission to consider reviewing the Accreditation Standards (**Appendix 1**).

At this meeting, the DH RC reconsidered its Winter 2022 proposed revisions to Standards 2-14 and 3-6 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs (**Appendix 3, Policy Report p. 403**), along with the letters received in the Commission office (**Appendices 1, 4, and 5, Policy Report p. 403; and Appendix 1**).

Related to the requested revisions to faculty to student ratios (Standard 3-5), the DH RC noted that teaching ratios have a long-standing history within the CODA Accreditation Standards for allied dental education programs. The ratios are in place to ensure appropriate instruction and supervision of students as a critical component to the quality of education and skill development,

as well as to ensure protection of the student and patient. Further, several disciplines within CODA's purview have standards related to teaching ratios, including advanced dental education programs in oral and maxillofacial surgery and orthodontics and dentofacial orthopedics. Following discussion, the DH RC believed there should be no change to the Standards related to faculty to student ratios.

Related to the requested revisions to faculty qualifications (Standard 3-6), the DH RC reviewed its Winter 2022 proposed revisions and determined that the proposed revisions to require full-time faculty to hold a master's degree or be enrolled in a master's degree program should not move forward at this time. In review of the recent letters suggesting modification to Standard 3-6, the DH RC noted the recent multi-year review and revision process leading to the current Dental Hygiene Standards that took effect on July 1, 2022. The DH RC believed the revision was appropriately vetted, considered by CODA's broad communities of interest, and is reflective of the educational background that supports faculty and students in dental hygiene education programs. Following discussion, the DH RC believed there should be no change to the Standards related to faculty qualifications.

Finally, related to Dental Hygiene Standard 2-14 (all types of classifications of periodontal disease), the DH RC reviewed its Winter 2022 proposed revisions and engaged in a lengthy discussion related to the new terminology to classify periodontal disease. Following discussion, the DH RC recommended the proposed revision to Standard 2-14 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs (**Appendix 2**) be circulated to the communities of interest for six (6) months, for review and comment, with a Hearing conducted in conjunction with the October 2022 American Dental Association meeting, with comments reviewed at the Commission's Winter 2023 meetings.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation direct there be no revision to Standard 3-5 (faculty to student ratios) and Standard 3-6 (faculty qualifications) of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs.

It is further recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation direct circulation of the proposed revision to Standard 2-14 of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs (**Appendix 2**) to the communities of interest for six (6) months, for review and comment, with a Hearing conducted in conjunction with the October 2022 American Dental Association meeting, with comments reviewed at the Commission's Winter 2023 meetings.

#### **CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATING TO MORE THAN ONE REVIEW COMMITTEE**

Matters related to more than one review committee are included in a separate report.

**CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO ACCREDITATION STATUS**

Matters related to accreditation status of programs are included in a separate report.

Respectfully submitted,

Dr. Susan Kass  
Chair, Review Committee on Dental Hygiene Education

June 27, 2022

Dr. Bruce Rotter, Chair  
Commission on Dental Accreditation  
211 East Chicago Avenue  
Chicago, IL 60611

Dear Dr. Rotter,

The ADA Council on Dental Education and Licensure has subject matter responsibility for matters related to the accreditation of dental, advanced dental and allied dental education programs. At its June 16-17, 2022 meeting, the Council reviewed the correspondence dated May 19, 2022 to the Commission on Dental Accreditation from sixteen state dental associations requesting consideration of revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs.

The Council appreciated the thoughtful and deliberate nature of the state dental associations' request, recognizing the shortage of dental hygienists and its impact on access to patient care. Accordingly, the Council requests the Commission to consider reviewing the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs regarding faculty-to-student ratios and the qualifications of clinical faculty members as requested in the letter.

Thank you for your consideration of the suggested revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs.

Sincerely,

*Donna Thomas-Moses*

Donna Thomas-Moses, D.M.D., P.C.  
Chair, Council on Dental Education and Licensure

DTM:kh/ap

cc: Alaska Dental Society  
Colorado Dental Association  
Connecticut State Dental Association  
Idaho State Dental Association  
Indiana Dental Association  
Missouri Dental Association  
Montana Dental Association  
New Mexico Dental Association  
Ohio Dental Association  
Oregon Dental Association  
Rhode Island Dental Association  
Tennessee Dental Association

Virginia Dental Association  
Washington State Dental Association  
Wisconsin Dental Association  
Wyoming Dental Association  
Dr. Susan Kass, Chair, CODA Review Committee on Dental Hygiene Education  
Dr. Sherin Tooks, Director, Commission on Dental Accreditation  
Dr. James A. Hoddick, Chair, Council on Dental Practice  
Dr. Hana Alberti, Director, Council on Dental Practice  
Dr. Donna Thomas-Moses, Chair, Council on Dental Education and Licensure  
Ms. Karen Hart, Director, Council on Dental Education Licensure  
Dr. Cesar R. Sabates, President, American Dental Association  
Dr. Raymond A. Cohlma, Executive Director, American Dental Association



# Commission on Dental Accreditation

---

**Proposed Revision to Standard 2-14**  
Additions are **Underlined**  
**~~Strikethroughs~~** indicate Deletions

## Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs

# **Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs**

**Commission on Dental Accreditation  
211 East Chicago Avenue  
Chicago, Illinois 60611  
312/440-4653  
[www.ada.org/coda](http://www.ada.org/coda)**

**Effective July 1, 2022**

## STANDARD 2 - EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM

### Patient Care Competencies

- 1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6 **2-14 Graduates must be competent in providing dental hygiene care for all stages and**  
7 **grades of periodontal disease. ~~types of classifications of periodontal diseases~~**  
8 **~~including patients who exhibit moderate to severe periodontal disease.~~**  
9

10 **Intent:**

11 *The total number and type of patients for whom each student provides dental hygiene*  
12 *care should be sufficient to ensure competency in all components of dental hygiene*  
13 *practice. A patient pool should be available to provide patient experiences in all stages*  
14 *and grades of periodontal disease, ~~classifications of periodontal patients,~~ including both*  
15 *maintenance and those newly diagnosed. These experiences should be monitored to*  
16 *ensure equal opportunity for each enrolled student.*  
17

18 **Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:**

- 19 • program criteria for stages and grades of periodontal disease ~~classification of~~  
20 ~~periodontal disease~~  
21 • program clinical and radiographic experiences  
22 • patient tracking data for enrolled and past students  
23 • policies regarding selection of patients, ~~and~~ assignment of procedures, and referrals  
24 • monitoring or tracking system protocols  
25 • clinical evaluation mechanism demonstrating student competence  
26