

**INFORMATIONAL REPORT ON FREQUENCY OF CITINGS OF
ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION
PROGRAMS IN PERIODONTICS**

Background: The Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Periodontics were approved by the Commission on Dental Accreditation at its January 2013 meeting and were implemented on January 1, 2014. Since that date, 69 site visits have been conducted by visiting committees of the Commission utilizing the January 2014 Standards. At the time of this report, the Standards include 91 “must” statements addressing 177 required areas of compliance. This report presents the number of times areas of non-compliance were cited by visiting committees conducting site visits from January 1, 2014, through October 31, 2022. If special (focused or comprehensive), pre-enrollment, or pre-graduation site visits were conducted during this period, citings from those visits are also included.

Analysis: The distribution of citings is presented in **Appendix 1**. There were 28 citings total. The most frequently cited standard, with seven (7) citings, occurred under Standard 4-11b, related to clinical training to the level of competency in adult minimal enteral and moderate parenteral sedation as prescribed by the *ADA Guidelines for Teaching Pain Control and Sedation to Dentists and Dental Students*. Four (4) citings occurred under Standard 4-10.2d regarding provisionalization of dental implants. Two (2) citings were noted under Standard 4-11a, related to in-depth knowledge in all areas of minimal, moderate and deep sedation as prescribed by the *ADA Guidelines for Teaching Pain Control and Sedation to Dentists and Dental Students*. There were also two (2) citings under Standard 4-13.1, which states that the use of private office facilities not affiliated with a university as a means of providing clinical experiences is not approved.

Summary: The Commission will continue to receive reports annually summarizing the updated data on the frequency of citings of individual Standards.

Recommendation: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

**ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION
PROGRAMS IN PERIODONTICS**

Frequency of Citings Based on Required Areas of Compliance

Total Number Programs Evaluated: 69
January 1, 2014 through October 31, 2022

STANDARD 1 – INSTITUTIONAL COMMITMENT/PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS –
23 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 2 – PROGRAM DIRECTOR & TEACHING STAFF – 22 Required Areas
of Compliance

STANDARD 3 – FACILITIES AND RESOURCES – 13 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 4 – CURRICULUM AND PROGRAM DURATION – 96 Required Areas
of Compliance

Noncompliance Citings	<u>Accreditation Standard</u>	Required Area of Compliance
	4-8	The educational program must provide clinical training for the student/resident to the level of competency. This must include, but is not limited to, the following treatment methods for health, comfort, function and esthetics:
1	4-8a	a. Nonsurgical management of periodontal diseases, including: 1. Biofilm control; 2. Mechanical scaling and root planing therapy; 3. Local and systemic adjunctive therapy; and 4. Occlusal therapy.
1	4-8b	b. Surgical management of periodontal diseases and conditions, including: 1. Resective surgery, including gingivoplasty, gingivectomy, periodontal flap procedures, osteoplasty, ostectomy, and tooth/root resection; 2. Regenerative and reparative surgery including osseous grafting, guided tissue regeneration, the use of biologics, and utilization of tissue substitutes, where appropriate; and

		3. Periodontal plastic and esthetic surgery techniques including gingival augmentation, root coverage procedures and crown lengthening surgery.
1	4-8c	c. Tooth extraction in the course of periodontal and implant therapy.
	4-10.2	Clinical training in dental implant therapy to the level of competency must include:
1	4-10.2a	a. Implant site development to include hard and soft tissue preservation and reconstruction, including ridge augmentation and sinus floor elevation;
1	4-10.2b	b. Surgical placement of implants; and
1	4-10.2c	c. Management of peri-implant tissues in health and disease.
4	4-10.2d	d. Provisionalization of dental implants.
	4-11	The educational program must provide training for the student/resident in the methods of pain and anxiety control to achieve:
2	4-11a	In-depth knowledge in all areas of minimal, moderate and deep sedation as prescribed by the <i>ADA Guidelines for Teaching Pain Control and Sedation to Dentists and Dental Students</i> ; and
7	4-11b	Clinical training to the level of competency in adult minimal enteral and moderate parenteral sedation as prescribed by the <i>ADA Guidelines for Teaching Pain Control and Sedation to Dentists and Dental Students</i> .
2	4-13.1	The use of private office facilities not affiliated with a university as a means of providing clinical experiences in advanced dental education is not approved.

STANDARD 5 – ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION STUDENTS/RESIDENTS –
20 Required Areas of Compliance

Noncompliance Citings	<u>Accreditation Standard</u>	Required Area of Compliance
		A system of ongoing evaluation and advancement must ensure that, through the director and faculty, each program:
1	5a, Evaluation	Periodically, but at least semiannually, assesses the progress toward (formative assessment) and achievement of (summative assessment) the competencies for the discipline using formal evaluation methods.
1	5b, Evaluation	Provides to students/residents an assessment of their performance, at least semiannually;
1	5c, Evaluation	Advances students/residents to positions of higher responsibility only on the basis of an evaluation of their readiness for advancement; and
1	5d, Evaluation	Maintains a personal record of evaluation for each student/resident which is accessible to the student/resident and available for review during site visits.
1	5-1	Written criteria for evaluating the quality of a student's/resident's performance must be used.
1	5-1.2	Evaluation results must be provided to students/residents in writing.

STANDARD 6 – RESEARCH – 3 Required Areas of Compliance

CONSIDERATION OF PROPOSED REVISIONS TO ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS RELATED TO SPONSORING INSTITUTION AND AUTHORITY TO OPERATE

Background: At its Winter 2022 meeting, the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) directed the formation of an Ad Hoc Committee to consider the changing landscape of health care delivery centers that may sponsor advanced dental education programs. The following individuals composed the Ad Hoc Committee to Consider Advanced Dental Education Deliver Models: Dr. Joel Berg (PED RC, chair of committee), Dr. Evanthia Anadioti (PROS RC), Dr. Victor Badner (DPH RC), Dr. Indraneel Bhattacharyya (OMP RC), Dr. Joseph Cohen (OP RC), Dr. Scott DeRossi (OM RC), Dr. Scott DeVito (Public), Dr. Joseph Giovannitti (DENTANES RC), Dr. George Kushner (OMS RC), Dr. Brent Larson (ORTHO RC), Dr. Paul Luepke (PERIO RC), Dr. Sanjay Mallya (OMR RC), Dr. Garry Myers (ENDO RC), and Dr. Miriam Robbins (PGD RC).

The Ad Hoc Committee, which met on December 5, 2022 and January 25, 2023, was charged with two (2) primary considerations: 1) the topic of institutional sponsor, whether a sponsor is an academic institution, hospital, or health care organization, and 2) the standard found in some advanced dental education disciplines that requires the sponsor have proper chartering/licensure to operate and offer instruction leading to a degree, diploma or certificate with recognized education validity.

Institutional Sponsor (Health Care Organizations): The Ad Hoc Committee discussed the types of institutions that may sponsor advanced dental education programs. The Committee was reminded that CODA holds United States Department of Education (USDE) recognition as a programmatic accrediting agency; therefore, all educational standards within CODA's purview include a requirement for institutional sponsor accreditation/recognition to ensure institutional oversight by an external agency. Regarding CODA's USDE recognition, it was noted there would be no concern in modifying the Standards with regard to institutional accreditation/recognition.

It was also noted that in five (5) of the 14 advanced dental education programs within the Commission's purview, the Standards permit the program's sponsor to be an educational institution, hospital, or health care organization (with/without affiliation with an accredited hospital, as specified in the Standards). In the remaining nine (9) advanced education disciplines, the sponsor must be an educational institution or hospital. All standards permit United States military programs to sponsor advanced dental education programs, as specified in the Standards.

The Ad Hoc Committee discussed the issue of institutional sponsor given current Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA) grant opportunities for health care organizations that may sponsor advanced dental education programs. The Ad Hoc Committee discussed the

Consideration of Proposed Standards Revisions Related to
Sponsoring Institution and Authority to Operate
CODA Summer 2023

term “health care organization” at length, including the type of entity that may be classified within this category and whether a definition of health care organization should be included in the CODA Standards. The Committee believed that a definition should be included in the Commission’s Definition of Terms, to ensure clarity and transparency in the type of organization that is permitted to sponsor an advanced dental education program, for those standards that currently include the term “health care organization” and those where the term may be adopted and implemented at a future date.

While discussing health care organizations that may sponsor advanced dental education programs, there continued to be discussion and concern that these sponsors have appropriate educational validity and expertise to carry out an academic program at the postdoctoral level. The Ad Hoc Committee considered whether all health care organizations should also have an affiliation with an academic institution to ensure educational quality. In discussion, it was noted that affiliations may exist (absent a need for co-sponsorship); however, many health care organizations currently offering CODA-accredited advanced dental education programs are not directly affiliated with academic institutions.

The Ad Hoc Committee determined that a definition of “Health Care Organization” and potential inclusion of “health care organization” as an acceptable sponsoring institution warrant further input from the Commission’s Review Committees to provide comment on the potential definition and inclusion of this term within their discipline-specific standards.

Following consideration of the Ad Hoc Committee’s recommendation, the Commission directed circulation of the proposed Definition of Terms for Health Care Organization and proposed revision to Standards related to institutional sponsors to include health care organizations (**Appendix 1**) be circulated to all Review Committees in Advanced Dental Education for consideration at the Summer 2023 Commission meetings, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023. The Review Committees should provide comment on the potential definition and inclusion of this term within their discipline-specific standards.

Charter/License to Operate and Offer Instruction: The Ad Hoc Committee also considered the current language in nine (9) advanced dental education programs’ Accreditation Standards, which states: “*Advanced dental education programs **must** be sponsored by institutions, which are properly chartered, and licensed to operate and offer instruction leading to degrees, diplomas or certificates with recognized education validity.*”

The Committee noted that the advanced dental education Standards for advanced education in general dentistry, dental anesthesiology, general practice residency, oral medicine, and orofacial pain do not currently include this requirement or an equivalent Standard. These five (5) disciplines recently reviewed their Accreditation Standards documents and tabled the discussion regarding inclusion of this requirement pending final recommendations of this Ad Hoc Committee and the Commission.

Consideration of Proposed Standards Revisions Related to
Sponsoring Institution and Authority to Operate
CODA Summer 2023

Through discussion, the Ad Hoc Committee noted that words such as “chartered,” “licensed,” and “validity” have very distinct legal meanings. The term “authorization” is often used in higher education to indicate that an institution can confer a degree. Chartering and licensing often have to do with legal entities and do not necessarily indicate authority to award a degree, diploma or certificate with recognized education validity. The Ad Hoc Committee also noted the confusion related to this requirement from both the institution’s/program’s perspective and that of the CODA site visitor.

The Ad Hoc Committee believed the intent of this Standard is to ensure educational validity, which in dental education is granted through the accreditation process undertaken by the Commission on Dental Accreditation. Additionally, the conferring of a degree is mandated through institutional accreditation, while conferring of a post-doctoral certificate or diploma is a state or federal function.

Following lengthy discussion, the Ad Hoc Committee concluded that the intent of the requirement is to ensure that the sponsoring organization has the appropriate authority to operate and, as applicable, the necessary approvals to award either a certificate or a degree. As such, the Ad Hoc Committee believed that the prior requirement should be stricken from all advanced dental education Standards and replaced with a new requirement, found in **Appendix 1**, which states (underline indicates addition): Advanced dental education programs conferring a certificate **must** have state or federal approval to operate and, as applicable, to confer a certificate. Advanced dental education programs conferring a degree **must** have institutional accreditation and authority to confer a degree. The Committee noted that an advanced dental education program conferring a certificate must have state or federal approval to operate and, if needed based on its specific jurisdiction (i.e., state or federal regulations), it may also need approval to award a certificate. Likewise, an advanced dental education program awarding a degree will be required to show institutional accreditation providing it the authority to do so.

Following consideration of the Ad Hoc Committee’s report, the Commission directed that the proposed revision related to chartering and licensure to operate warrants further input from the Commission’s Advanced Dental Education Review Committees. The Review Committees should provide comment on the proposed revision proposed revision within their discipline-specific standards.

Summary: Following discussions at two (2) meetings, the Ad Hoc Committee recommended circulation of the proposed Definition of Terms for Health Care Organization and proposed revision to Standards related to institutional sponsors to include health care organizations (**Appendix 1**) to all Review Committees in Advanced Dental Education for consideration at the Summer 2023 Commission meetings, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023. Additionally, the Ad Hoc Committee recommended the proposed revision related to chartering and licensure (**Appendix 1**) be circulated to all Review Committees in Advanced Dental

Consideration of Proposed Standards Revisions Related to
Sponsoring Institution and Authority to Operate
CODA Summer 2023

Education for consideration at the Summer 2023 Commission meetings, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023. The Committee also noted that a Review Committee's recommendation to revise the Standards would require a period of public comment and further consideration at a future Commission meeting, following the Commission's consideration in Summer 2023.

At its Winter 2023 meeting, the Commission concurred with the Ad Hoc Committee's recommendations and directed all advanced dental education Review Committees to consider the proposed revisions to advanced dental education Standards found in **Appendix 1**, related to sponsoring organization and authority to operate, for possible adoption and implementation, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023.

Recommendation:

**PROPOSED REVISIONS TO ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED
DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS RELATED TO SPONSORING INSTITUTION
AND AUTHORITY TO OPERATE**

Additions are underlined; Deletions are ~~stricken~~

**PROPOSED REVISIONS FOR ALL ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION
STANDARDS:**

Definition of Terms:

Health Care Organization: A Federally Qualified Health Center (FQHC), Indian Health Service (IHS), Veterans Health Administration system (VA), or academic health center/medical center/ambulatory care center (both public and private) that is accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS).

Consideration of Proposed Standards Revisions Related to
Sponsoring Institution and Authority to Operate
CODA Summer 2023

PROPOSED REVISIONS FOR STANDARD 1 FOR DENTAL PUBLIC HEALTH, ENDODONTICS, ORAL AND MAXILLOFACIAL PATHOLOGY, ORAL AND MAXILLOFACIAL RADIOLOGY, ORTHODONTICS AND DENTOFACIAL ORTHOPEDICS, ORAL AND MAXILLOFACIAL SURGERY, PEDIATRIC DENTISTRY, PERIODONTICS, AND PROSTHODONTICS:

Standard 1-Institutional Commitment/Program Effectiveness

~~Advanced dental education programs must be sponsored by institutions, which are properly chartered, and licensed to operate and offer instruction leading to degrees, diplomas or certificates with recognized education validity.~~ Hospitals that sponsor advanced dental education programs **must** be accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). Educational institutions that sponsor advanced dental education programs **must** be accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education. Health care organizations that sponsor advanced dental education programs must be accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). The bylaws, rules and regulations of hospitals or health care organizations that sponsor or provide a substantial portion of advanced dental education programs **must** assure that dentists are eligible for medical staff membership and privileges including the right to vote, hold office, serve on medical staff committees and admit, manage and discharge patients.

United States military programs not sponsored or co-sponsored by military medical treatment facilities, United States-based educational institutions, hospitals or health care organizations accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS) **must** demonstrate successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection criteria.

Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:

- Accreditation certificate or current official listing of accredited institutions from a United States Department of Education recognized accreditation organization
- Evidence of successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection criteria
- Accreditation certificate or current official listing of accredited institution from an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). For example: Accreditation Association for Ambulatory Health Care (AAAHC); Accreditation Commission for Health Care, Inc. (ACHC); American Association for Accreditation of Ambulatory Surgery Facilities (AAAASF); American Osteopathic Association Healthcare Facilities Accreditation Program (AOA/HFAP); Center for Improvement in Healthcare Quality (CIHQ); Community Health Accreditation Program (CHAP); DNV GL-Healthcare (DNV GL); National Dialysis Accreditation Commission (NDAC); The Compliance Team (TCT); The Joint Commission (JC).

Consideration of Proposed Standards Revisions Related to
Sponsoring Institution and Authority to Operate
CODA Summer 2023

Advanced dental education programs conferring a certificate **must** have state or federal approval to operate and, as applicable, to confer a certificate. Advanced dental education programs conferring a degree **must** have institutional accreditation and authority to confer a degree.

Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:

- State license or federal authority documenting the institution's approval to operate and confer a credential
- Institutional accreditation indicating approval to confer a degree