

## **REPORT OF THE REVIEW COMMITTEE ON PREDOCTORAL DENTAL EDUCATION TO THE COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION**

Committee Chair: Dr. Cataldo Leone. Committee Members: Dr. Sillas Duarte (virtual), Dr. Kevin Haubrick, Ms. Danae Seyffer Kotula (virtual), Ms. Wilhemina Leeuw, Dr. Cataldo Leone (chair), Dr. Thomas McConnell (virtual), Dr. Scott Phillips, Dr. Daniel Shin, and Dr. Deborah Weisfuse-Lipner. Guests (Open Session Only, Virtual): Dr. Sheila Brear, chief learning officer, American Dental Education Association (ADEA) attended the policy portion of the meeting. Staff Members: Ms. Kelly Stapleton, manager, Predoctoral Dental Education, and Ms. Attiyya Muhammad, senior project assistant, CODA. Dr. Sherin Took, senior director, and Ms. Samara Schwartz (virtual), senior associate general counsel, CODA, attended a portion of the meeting. The meeting of the Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC) was held on January 6 – 7, 2025 at the ADA Headquarters, Chicago, Illinois and via a virtual meeting.

### **CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO PREDOCTORAL DENTAL EDUCATION AND DENTAL THERAPY EDUCATION**

#### **Informational Report on Predoctoral Dental Education Programs Annual Survey**

**Curriculum Section (p. 100)**: At its Winter 2015 meeting, the Commission directed that each Review Committee review a draft of its discipline-specific Annual Survey Curriculum Section during the Winter meeting in the year the Survey will be distributed. The Commission further suggested that each Review Committee review aggregate data of its discipline-specific Annual Survey Curriculum Section, as an informational report, when the materials are available following data collection and analysis. The Commission noted that all survey data is considered confidential at the programmatic level.

The Curriculum Section of the Commission's Annual Survey is conducted for predoctoral dental education in alternate years. The next Curriculum Section will be conducted in August 2025. The draft Curriculum Section instrument is provided in **Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 100**. Following review of the survey instrument and discussion, the PREDOR RC believed the Curriculum Section of the Annual Survey for predoctoral dental education programs should be retained for use in August 2025.

**Recommendation**: It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation retain, with no changes, the Curriculum Section of the Commission's Annual Survey for predoctoral dental education programs to be conducted in August 2025.

**Informational Report on Dental Therapy Programs Annual Survey Curriculum Section (p. 101)**: At its Winter 2015 meeting, the Commission directed that each Review Committee review a draft of its discipline-specific Annual Survey Curriculum Section during the Winter meeting in the year the Survey will be distributed. The Commission further suggested that each Review Committee review aggregate data of its discipline-specific Annual Survey Curriculum Section,

as an informational report, when the materials are available following data collection and analysis. The Commission noted that all survey data is considered confidential at the programmatic level.

The Curriculum Section of the Commission's Annual Survey is conducted for dental therapy in alternate years. The next Curriculum Section will be conducted in August 2025. The draft Curriculum Section instrument is provided in **Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 101**. Following review of the survey instrument and discussion, the PREDOR RC believed the Curriculum Section of the Annual Survey for dental therapy programs should be retained for use in August 2025.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation retain, with no changes, the Curriculum Section of the Commission's Annual Survey for dental therapy education programs to be conducted in August 2025.

**Informational Report on the Conduct of a Validity and Reliability Study for the Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs (p. 102):** The Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs were adopted by the Commission on Dental Accreditation at its February 6, 2015 meeting for implementation on August 7, 2015. The Commission accredited the first dental therapy education program in 2020.

As stated in the Commission's "Policy on Assessing the Validity and Reliability of the Accreditation Standards" (**Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 102**), the Commission believes that a minimum time span should elapse between the adoption of new standards or implementation of standards that have undergone a comprehensive revision and the assessment of the validity and reliability of these standards. This minimum period of time is directly related to the academic length of the accredited programs in each discipline. The Commission believes this minimum period is essential in order to allow time for programs to implement the new standards and to gain experience in each year of the curriculum.

The Commission's policy for assessment is based on the following formula:

***The validity and reliability of accreditation standards will be assessed after they have been in effect for a period of time equal to the minimum academic length of the accredited program plus three years.***

Thus, the validity and reliability of the new standards for a one-year program will be assessed after four years, while standards applying to programs two years in length will be assessed five years after implementation.

According to the Commission's timetable for validity and reliability studies, the study for dental therapy will be initiated in the spring of 2025. Survey results will be considered at the Summer 2025 meetings of the Predoctoral Dental Education Review Committee and the Commission on

Dental Accreditation. The communities will be surveyed to assist the Commission in determining whether the standards are still relevant and appropriate or whether a comprehensive revision should be initiated.

In cooperation with the ADA's Health Policy Institute (HPI), a timetable will be developed, surveys will be distributed to the audiences, and responses will be due to the HPI within two (2) weeks of receipt of the survey. A sample format of the survey is presented in **Appendix 2, Policy Report p. 102**. Following a period of follow-up with non-respondents, the data will be tabulated and analysis completed by June 1, 2025. Commission staff will prepare a report with results of the study for consideration by the Commission at its Summer 2025 meeting.

**Recommendation:** This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

**Consideration of Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs and Dental Therapy Education Programs Related to Administrative Oversight at Major Sites Where Educational Activity Occurs (p. 103):** At its Winter 2024 meeting, the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) directed an Ad Hoc or Standing Committee to investigate in-person, on-site work expectations for program directors to determine if changes are needed in the discipline-specific Accreditation Standards for dental education, advanced dental education, and allied dental education programs. As directed, in advance of the Summer 2024 CODA meeting, the Ad Hoc Committee, which was comprised of all current CODA Commissioners, reviewed the background materials, which included the Commission's action leading to the Ad Hoc Committee, and the Standards for each discipline related to program director (**Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 103**). The Committee noted that while all CODA Standards have a requirement for clinical supervision at all educational activity sites, most Standards do not address overall administrative oversight of the program, by the program director or a designee, at all sites where a student spends a majority or all their time. The Committee discussed whether virtual oversight or assignment of a responsible individual would be appropriate at all educational sites. The Committee believed there must be consistency in the educational program at all program sites. Following consideration, the Ad Hoc Committee concluded that each Review Committee that does not currently have a Standard related to administrative oversight at major educational activity sites (e.g., off-campus sites where students spend a majority or all their time) should review this topic and determine whether a Standard is needed to address the Commission's expectation for administrative oversight, for consideration by the Commission in Winter 2025. In considering this matter, the Commission noted that inclusion of Intent Statements, in conjunction with proposed Standards, could further clarify the flexibility permitted for programs to oversee educational sites in a variety of ways, while ensuring administrative oversight and consistency in the educational program across all sites. At its Summer 2024 meeting, the Commission on Dental Accreditation concurred with the recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee.

At its Winter 2025 meeting, the Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC) considered the dental education and dental therapy education Accreditation Standards

**(Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 103)** related to administrative oversight at major educational activity sites (e.g., off-campus sites where students spend a majority or all their time) to determine whether revisions are needed to address the Commission's expectation for administrative oversight. The Review Committee noted that within dental education sites could vary from rotational sites for minor or major experiences, to a satellite campus of the program where students spend a significant amount of time. Rotational sites are often overseen by the site's own administration, while satellite campus sites are often overseen by the dental program and its sponsoring institution. The Committee believed that clarification may be necessary for sites where educational activity occurs where a cohort of students will spend a significant amount of time at a location away from the institution's main campus, such as students spending two (2) clinical years at another campus owned or operated by the institution/program. The Review Committee also believe that a Standard may not be necessary for sites where educational activity occurs where students rotate for a limited period to gain educational experiences and then return to the institution's/program's main facility.

Following consideration of the report, the Review Committee determined that the Ad Hoc Committee to Review Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs should consider this topic with the proposed revisions for dental education programs. Regarding dental therapy education programs, the Review Committee determined that this topic should be considered with the upcoming Validity and Reliability Study for the Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs in 2025 and that the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs could be considered in this review, if applicable, for dental therapy education programs.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation direct the Ad Hoc Committee to Review Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs to consider administrative oversight at major sites where educational activity occurs in the proposed revisions of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs, with a future report to the Predoctoral Dental Education Review Committee and Commission.

It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation direct that consideration of administrative oversight at major sites where educational activity occurs be included in discussions of the Predoctoral Dental Education Review Committee following the 2025 Validity and Reliability Study of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs with consideration of the proposed revisions for predoctoral dental education programs, if applicable, and a future report to the Commission.

**Consideration of Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs and Dental Therapy Education Programs Related to Diversity and Humanistic Culture and Learning Environment (p. 104):** On December 1, 2023, the Commission received a letter from The National Coalition of Dentists for Health Equity (TNCDHE) (**Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 104**), which provided short-term and long-term suggestions to CODA to improve diversity in all

academic dental, allied dental, and advanced dental education programs. In Winter 2024, each Review Committee of the Commission provided comment to CODA on TNCDHE letter. Following consideration of Review Committee Reports, the Commission directed establishment of an Ad Hoc Committee composed of all Commissioners who chair the discipline-specific Review Committees in dental, allied dental, and advanced dental education, and additional CODA Commissioners, to study the Accreditation Standards for possible revision related to the letter from TNCDHE.

In advance of the Commission's Summer 2024 meeting, the Ad Hoc Committee, which was comprised of all current CODA Commissioners, reviewed the background materials, which included the prior work of the Commission on this topic, the letters from TNCDHE, CODA Standards related to diversity and the humanistic culture including proposed revisions, Annual Survey data on dental programs related to diversity, and information from other accrediting agencies. The Committee noted that this is an important topic, but other considerations must also be acknowledged including differences among institutions related to missions, resources, funding, state and federal regulations, and legal considerations. It was noted that some states do not permit initiatives focused on diversity, and the Commission cannot impose Standards that would conflict with state or federal law. As such, the Committee noted the proposed predoctoral dental education Standard revision, which discusses diversity efforts, would be consistent with university policy and state law. At its Summer 2024 meeting, following consideration of the Ad Hoc Committee Report, the Commission directed that all Review Committees consider the proposed revisions for the Dental Standards 1-2 and 1-3 and revisions for the Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Standards 1-11 and 2-1.7 (adopted Summer 2024), for possible inclusion of similar Standards within the Review Committee's own discipline(s) to address diversity and the humanistic culture, with a report to the Commission in Winter 2025.

At its Winter 2025 meeting, the Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education (PREDOC RC) considered the dental education and dental therapy education Accreditation Standards, and reference materials including the proposed Dental Standards 1-2 and 1-3 and adopted revisions for Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Standards 1-11 and 2-1.7 (**Appendix 2, Policy Report p. 104**) for possible inclusion of similar Standards to address diversity and the humanistic culture and learning environment.

Following consideration of the report, the Review Committee noted that the proposed revisions to Dental Standards 1-2 and 1-3 were circulated to the communities of interest for comment in Fall 2024. The PREDOC RC recalled that the Ad Hoc Committee to Review Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs will continue to review and consider any comments on these Standards in its upcoming meetings in Spring 2025, with a future report to the PREDOC RC and Commission. Related to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs, the Review Committee noted that the current Standards on diversity and the humanistic culture and learning environment were originally derived from the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs. Thus, the Review Committee determined that this topic should be considered with the upcoming Validity and Reliability Study for the

Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs in 2025 and that the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs be considered in this review for dental therapy education programs with a future report to the Commission.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation direct the Ad Hoc Committee to Review Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs continue to consider diversity and the humanistic culture and learning environment in the proposed revisions of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs, with a future report to the Predoctoral Dental Education Review Committee and Commission.

It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation direct that consideration of diversity and the humanistic culture and learning environment be included in discussions of the Predoctoral Dental Education Review Committee following the 2025 Validity and Reliability Study of the Accreditation Standards for Dental Therapy Education Programs with consideration of the proposed revisions for predoctoral dental education programs, and a future report to the Commission.

## NEW BUSINESS

**Informational Report on the Ad Hoc Committee to Review Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs:** The Review Committee received an update on the Ad Hoc Committee's progress, noting that the proposed comprehensive revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Dental Education Programs were circulated to communities of interest in Fall 2024 and included in a Hearing on Standards in Fall 2024. The Commission received a significant number and variety of comments for consideration. The Ad Hoc Committee has reconvened and conducted one (1) meeting since closure of the comment period and will continue its work in Spring 2025 to review and consider all received comments regarding the proposed revisions, with a future report to the Predoctoral Dental Education Review Committee and Commission.

**Recommendation:** This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

## CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATING TO MORE THAN ONE REVIEW COMMITTEE

Matters related to more than one review committee are included in a separate report.

## CONSIDERATION OF SITE VISITOR APPOINTMENTS TO THE COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION IN THE AREA OF PREDOCTORAL DENTAL EDUCATION AND DENTAL THERAPY EDUCATION

The Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education considered site visitor appointments for 2025-2026. The Committee's recommendations on the appointments of individuals are included in a separate report.

**CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO ACCREDITATION STATUS**

Matters related to accreditation status of programs are included in a separate report.

Respectfully submitted,

Dr. Cataldo Leone  
Chair, Review Committee on Predoctoral Dental Education