

**INFORMATIONAL REPORT ON FREQUENCY OF CITINGS OF
ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION
PROGRAMS IN ENDODONTICS**

Background: The Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Endodontics were approved by the Commission on Dental Accreditation in January 2013, with implementation on January 1, 2014. Since the implementation date, 69 site visits have been conducted by visiting committees of the Commission utilizing the January 2014 Standards. At the time of this report, the Standards include 77 “must” statements addressing 143 required areas of compliance. This report presents the number of times areas of non-compliance were cited by visiting committees conducting site visits from January 1, 2014, through June 30, 2022. If special (focused or comprehensive), pre-enrollment, or pre-graduation site visits were conducted during this period, citings from those visits are also included.

Analysis: The distribution of citings is presented in **Appendix 1**. There has been one (1) citing during the period covered by this report, which was in the area of non-surgical and surgical endodontic treatment and retreatment. Due to the limited number of citings, no analysis can be performed at this time.

Summary: The Commission will continue to receive reports annually summarizing the updated data on the frequency of citings of individual Standards. The revised Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Endodontics was adopted February 12, 2021 and implemented July 1, 2022. Therefore, this report concludes the Frequency of Citings for the January 2014 Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Endodontics.

Recommendation: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

**ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR
 ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS IN ENDODONTICS
 (January 2014 Standards)**

Frequency of Citings Based on Required Areas of Compliance

Total Number Programs Evaluated: 69
 January 1, 2014, through June 30, 2022

STANDARD 1 - INSTITUTIONAL COMMITMENT/PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS –
 23 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 2 – PROGRAM DIRECTOR & TEACHING STAFF – 27 Required Areas
 of Compliance

STANDARD 3 – FACILITIES AND RESOURCES – 15 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 4 – CURRICULUM AND PROGRAM DURATION – 60 Required Areas
 of Compliance

Noncompliance Citings	<u>Accreditation Standard</u>	Required Area of Compliance
		The educational program must provide in-depth instruction and clinical training so that students/residents are competent in:
1	4-8.b	Non-surgical and surgical endodontic treatment and retreatment

STANDARD 5 – ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION STUDENTS/RESIDENTS –
 15 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 6 – RESEARCH – 3 Required Areas of Compliance

**INFORMATIONAL REPORT ON FREQUENCY OF CITINGS OF ACCREDITATION
STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS IN
ENDODONTICS**

Background: The Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Endodontics were approved by the Commission on Dental Accreditation on February 12, 2021, with implementation on July 1, 2022. Since the implementation date, five (5) site visits have been conducted by visiting committees of the Commission utilizing the July 2022 Standards. At the time of this report, the Standards include 79 “must” statements addressing 133 required areas of compliance. This report presents the number of times areas of non-compliance were cited by visiting committees conducting site visits from July 1, 2022, through October 31, 2022. If special (focused or comprehensive), pre-enrollment, or pre-graduation site visits were conducted during this period, citings from those visits are also included.

Analysis: The distribution of citings is presented in **Appendix 1**. There has been three (3) citings during the period covered by this report, in the areas of hours devoted in clinical care (Standard 4-6), active participation in endodontics interdisciplinary seminars and conferences (Standard 4-13), and eligible applicants to the advanced dental education program (Standard 5). Due to the limited number of citings, no analysis can be performed at this time.

Summary: The Commission will continue to receive reports annually summarizing the updated data on the frequency of citings of individual Standards.

Recommendation: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

**ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR
ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS IN ENDODONTICS
(July 2022 Standards)**

Frequency of Citings Based on Required Areas of Compliance

Total Number Programs Evaluated: 5
July 1, 2022, through October 31, 2022

STANDARD 1 - INSTITUTIONAL COMMITMENT/PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS –
18 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 2 – PROGRAM DIRECTOR & TEACHING STAFF – 26 Required Areas
of Compliance

STANDARD 3 – FACILITIES AND RESOURCES – 15 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 4 – CURRICULUM AND PROGRAM DURATION – 59 Required Areas
of Compliance

Noncompliance Citings	<u>Accreditation Standard</u>	Required Area of Compliance
1	4-6	A minimum of 40% and a maximum of 60% of the total clock hours in a two year (24 months) program must be devoted to clinical care.
1	4-13	Students/Residents must actively participate in endodontic and interdisciplinary seminars and conferences evaluating diagnostic data, treatment plans, treatment procedures, and outcomes assessment.

STANDARD 5 – ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION STUDENTS/RESIDENTS –
12 Required Areas of Compliance

Noncompliance Citings	<u>Accreditation Standard</u>	Required Area of Compliance
	<u>5</u>	Eligible applicants to advanced dental education programs accredited by the Commission on Dental Accreditation must be graduates from:
1	5b	Predoctoral dental programs in Canada accredited by the

		Commission on Dental Accreditation of Canada; or
--	--	--

STANDARD 6 – RESEARCH – 3 Required Areas of Compliance

CONSIDERATION OF PROPOSED REVISIONS TO ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS RELATED TO SPONSORING INSTITUTION AND AUTHORITY TO OPERATE

Background: At its Winter 2022 meeting, the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) directed the formation of an Ad Hoc Committee to consider the changing landscape of health care delivery centers that may sponsor advanced dental education programs. The following individuals composed the Ad Hoc Committee to Consider Advanced Dental Education Deliver Models: Dr. Joel Berg (PED RC, chair of committee), Dr. Evanthia Anadioti (PROS RC), Dr. Victor Badner (DPH RC), Dr. Indraneel Bhattacharyya (OMP RC), Dr. Joseph Cohen (OP RC), Dr. Scott DeRossi (OM RC), Dr. Scott DeVito (Public), Dr. Joseph Giovannitti (DENTANES RC), Dr. George Kushner (OMS RC), Dr. Brent Larson (ORTHO RC), Dr. Paul Luepke (PERIO RC), Dr. Sanjay Mallya (OMR RC), Dr. Garry Myers (ENDO RC), and Dr. Miriam Robbins (PGD RC).

The Ad Hoc Committee, which met on December 5, 2022 and January 25, 2023, was charged with two (2) primary considerations: 1) the topic of institutional sponsor, whether a sponsor is an academic institution, hospital, or health care organization, and 2) the standard found in some advanced dental education disciplines that requires the sponsor have proper chartering/licensure to operate and offer instruction leading to a degree, diploma or certificate with recognized education validity.

Institutional Sponsor (Health Care Organizations): The Ad Hoc Committee discussed the types of institutions that may sponsor advanced dental education programs. The Committee was reminded that CODA holds United States Department of Education (USDE) recognition as a programmatic accrediting agency; therefore, all educational standards within CODA's purview include a requirement for institutional sponsor accreditation/recognition to ensure institutional oversight by an external agency. Regarding CODA's USDE recognition, it was noted there would be no concern in modifying the Standards with regard to institutional accreditation/recognition.

It was also noted that in five (5) of the 14 advanced dental education programs within the Commission's purview, the Standards permit the program's sponsor to be an educational institution, hospital, or health care organization (with/without affiliation with an accredited hospital, as specified in the Standards). In the remaining nine (9) advanced education disciplines, the sponsor must be an educational institution or hospital. All standards permit United States military programs to sponsor advanced dental education programs, as specified in the Standards.

The Ad Hoc Committee discussed the issue of institutional sponsor given current Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA) grant opportunities for health care organizations that may sponsor advanced dental education programs. The Ad Hoc Committee discussed the

term “health care organization” at length, including the type of entity that may be classified within this category and whether a definition of health care organization should be included in the CODA Standards. The Committee believed that a definition should be included in the Commission’s Definition of Terms, to ensure clarity and transparency in the type of organization that is permitted to sponsor an advanced dental education program, for those standards that currently include the term “health care organization” and those where the term may be adopted and implemented at a future date.

While discussing health care organizations that may sponsor advanced dental education programs, there continued to be discussion and concern that these sponsors have appropriate educational validity and expertise to carry out an academic program at the postdoctoral level. The Ad Hoc Committee considered whether all health care organizations should also have an affiliation with an academic institution to ensure educational quality. In discussion, it was noted that affiliations may exist (absent a need for co-sponsorship); however, many health care organizations currently offering CODA-accredited advanced dental education programs are not directly affiliated with academic institutions.

The Ad Hoc Committee determined that a definition of “Health Care Organization” and potential inclusion of “health care organization” as an acceptable sponsoring institution warrant further input from the Commission’s Review Committees to provide comment on the potential definition and inclusion of this term within their discipline-specific standards.

Following consideration of the Ad Hoc Committee’s recommendation, the Commission directed circulation of the proposed Definition of Terms for Health Care Organization and proposed revision to Standards related to institutional sponsors to include health care organizations (**Appendix 1**) be circulated to all Review Committees in Advanced Dental Education for consideration at the Summer 2023 Commission meetings, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023. The Review Committees should provide comment on the potential definition and inclusion of this term within their discipline-specific standards.

Charter/License to Operate and Offer Instruction: The Ad Hoc Committee also considered the current language in nine (9) advanced dental education programs’ Accreditation Standards, which states: “*Advanced dental education programs **must** be sponsored by institutions, which are properly chartered, and licensed to operate and offer instruction leading to degrees, diplomas or certificates with recognized education validity.*”

The Committee noted that the advanced dental education Standards for advanced education in general dentistry, dental anesthesiology, general practice residency, oral medicine, and orofacial pain do not currently include this requirement or an equivalent Standard. These five (5) disciplines recently reviewed their Accreditation Standards documents and tabled the discussion regarding inclusion of this requirement pending final recommendations of this Ad Hoc Committee and the Commission.

Through discussion, the Ad Hoc Committee noted that words such as “chartered,” “licensed,” and “validity” have very distinct legal meanings. The term “authorization” is often used in higher education to indicate that an institution can confer a degree. Chartering and licensing often have to do with legal entities and do not necessarily indicate authority to award a degree, diploma or certificate with recognized education validity. The Ad Hoc Committee also noted the confusion related to this requirement from both the institution’s/program’s perspective and that of the CODA site visitor.

The Ad Hoc Committee believed the intent of this Standard is to ensure educational validity, which in dental education is granted through the accreditation process undertaken by the Commission on Dental Accreditation. Additionally, the conferring of a degree is mandated through institutional accreditation, while conferring of a post-doctoral certificate or diploma is a state or federal function.

Following lengthy discussion, the Ad Hoc Committee concluded that the intent of the requirement is to ensure that the sponsoring organization has the appropriate authority to operate and, as applicable, the necessary approvals to award either a certificate or a degree. As such, the Ad Hoc Committee believed that the prior requirement should be stricken from all advanced dental education Standards and replaced with a new requirement, found in **Appendix 1**, which states (underline indicates addition): Advanced dental education programs conferring a certificate **must** have state or federal approval to operate and, as applicable, to confer a certificate. Advanced dental education programs conferring a degree **must** have institutional accreditation and authority to confer a degree. The Committee noted that an advanced dental education program conferring a certificate must have state or federal approval to operate and, if needed based on its specific jurisdiction (i.e., state or federal regulations), it may also need approval to award a certificate. Likewise, an advanced dental education program awarding a degree will be required to show institutional accreditation providing it the authority to do so.

Following consideration of the Ad Hoc Committee’s report, the Commission directed that the proposed revision related to chartering and licensure to operate warrants further input from the Commission’s Advanced Dental Education Review Committees. The Review Committees should provide comment on the proposed revision proposed revision within their discipline-specific standards.

Summary: Following discussions at two (2) meetings, the Ad Hoc Committee recommended circulation of the proposed Definition of Terms for Health Care Organization and proposed revision to Standards related to institutional sponsors to include health care organizations (**Appendix 1**) to all Review Committees in Advanced Dental Education for consideration at the Summer 2023 Commission meetings, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023. Additionally, the Ad Hoc Committee recommended the proposed revision related to chartering and licensure (**Appendix 1**) be circulated to all Review Committees in Advanced Dental

Education for consideration at the Summer 2023 Commission meetings, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023. The Committee also noted that a Review Committee's recommendation to revise the Standards would require a period of public comment and further consideration at a future Commission meeting, following the Commission's consideration in Summer 2023.

At its Winter 2023 meeting, the Commission concurred with the Ad Hoc Committee's recommendations and directed all advanced dental education Review Committees to consider the proposed revisions to advanced dental education Standards found in **Appendix 1**, related to sponsoring organization and authority to operate, for possible adoption and implementation, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023.

Recommendation:

**PROPOSED REVISIONS TO ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED
DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS RELATED TO SPONSORING INSTITUTION
AND AUTHORITY TO OPERATE**

Additions are underlined; Deletions are ~~stricken~~

**PROPOSED REVISIONS FOR ALL ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION
STANDARDS:**

Definition of Terms:

Health Care Organization: A Federally Qualified Health Center (FQHC), Indian Health Service (IHS), Veterans Health Administration system (VA), or academic health center/medical center/ambulatory care center (both public and private) that is accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS).

Consideration of Proposed Standards Revisions Related to
Sponsoring Institution and Authority to Operate
CODA Summer 2023

PROPOSED REVISIONS FOR STANDARD 1 FOR DENTAL PUBLIC HEALTH, ENDODONTICS, ORAL AND MAXILLOFACIAL PATHOLOGY, ORAL AND MAXILLOFACIAL RADIOLOGY, ORTHODONTICS AND DENTOFACIAL ORTHOPEDICS, ORAL AND MAXILLOFACIAL SURGERY, PEDIATRIC DENTISTRY, PERIODONTICS, AND PROSTHODONTICS:

Standard 1-Institutional Commitment/Program Effectiveness

~~Advanced dental education programs must be sponsored by institutions, which are properly chartered, and licensed to operate and offer instruction leading to degrees, diplomas or certificates with recognized education validity.~~ Hospitals that sponsor advanced dental education programs **must** be accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). Educational institutions that sponsor advanced dental education programs **must** be accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education. Health care organizations that sponsor advanced dental education programs must be accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). The bylaws, rules and regulations of hospitals or health care organizations that sponsor or provide a substantial portion of advanced dental education programs **must** assure that dentists are eligible for medical staff membership and privileges including the right to vote, hold office, serve on medical staff committees and admit, manage and discharge patients.

United States military programs not sponsored or co-sponsored by military medical treatment facilities, United States-based educational institutions, hospitals or health care organizations accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS) **must** demonstrate successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection criteria.

Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:

- Accreditation certificate or current official listing of accredited institutions from a United States Department of Education recognized accreditation organization
- Evidence of successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection criteria
- Accreditation certificate or current official listing of accredited institution from an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). For example: Accreditation Association for Ambulatory Health Care (AAAHC); Accreditation Commission for Health Care, Inc. (ACHC); American Association for Accreditation of Ambulatory Surgery Facilities (AAAASF); American Osteopathic Association Healthcare Facilities Accreditation Program (AOA/HFAP); Center for Improvement in Healthcare Quality (CIHQ); Community Health Accreditation Program (CHAP); DNV GL-Healthcare (DNV GL); National Dialysis Accreditation Commission (NDAC); The Compliance Team (TCT); The Joint Commission (JC).

Advanced dental education programs conferring a certificate **must** have state or federal approval to operate and, as applicable, to confer a certificate. Advanced dental education programs conferring a degree **must** have institutional accreditation and authority to confer a degree.

Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:

- State license or federal authority documenting the institution's approval to operate and confer a credential
- Institutional accreditation indicating approval to confer a degree