

REPORT OF THE REVIEW COMMITTEE ON DENTAL ANESTHESIOLOGY EDUCATION TO THE COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION

Committee Chair: Dr. Joseph Giovannitti. Committee Members: Dr. Gerard Kugel, Dr. Mana Saraghi, Dr. Shashi Unnithan, and Dr. Philip Yen. Guest (Open Session Only, Virtual): Dr. Sheila Brear, chief learning officer, American Dental Education Association, attended the policy portion of the meeting. Staff Members: Ms. Peggy Soeldner, manager, Advanced Dental Education, Ms. Yesenia Ruiz, manager, Advanced Dental Education, and Ms. Bridget Blackwood, senior project assistant, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). Dr. Sherin Tooks, senior director, CODA, and Ms. Cathryn Albrecht, senior associate general counsel, CODA, attended a portion of the meeting. The meeting of the Review Committee on Dental Anesthesiology Education (DENTANES RC) was held on July 12, 2023 via a virtual meeting.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO DENTAL ANESTHESIOLOGY EDUCATION

Informational Report on Frequency of Citings of Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology (p. 1500): The Review Committee on Dental Anesthesiology Education (DENTANES RC) considered the annual report on the frequency of citings of the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology adopted and implemented January 25, 2007. Significant revisions were made to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology in 2012 and 2015. The DENTANES RC noted that 29 site visits were conducted from January 25, 2007 through October 31, 2022. An analysis of the site visit reports indicated a total of ten (10) citings of non-compliance were noted in the reports. Analysis of the data indicated that the most frequently cited Standard is Standard 1-5, written agreements, with four (4) citations. The Commission will continue to receive reports annually summarizing the updated data on the frequency of citings of individual Standards.

Recommendation: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

Consideration of Proposed Revision to Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs Related to Sponsoring Organization and Authority to Operate (p. 1501): At its Winter 2022 meeting, the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) directed the formation of an Ad Hoc Committee to consider the changing landscape of health care delivery centers that may sponsor advanced dental education programs.

The Ad Hoc Committee, which met on December 5, 2022 and January 25, 2023, was charged with two (2) primary considerations: 1) the topic of institutional sponsor, whether a sponsor is an academic institution, hospital, or health care organization, and 2) the standard found in some advanced dental education disciplines that requires the sponsor have proper chartering/licensure to operate and offer instruction leading to a degree, diploma or certificate with recognized education validity.

Institutional Sponsor (Health Care Organizations): The Ad Hoc Committee discussed the types of institutions that may sponsor advanced dental education programs. The Committee was reminded that CODA holds United States Department of Education (USDE) recognition as a programmatic accrediting agency; therefore, all educational standards within CODA's purview include a requirement for institutional sponsor accreditation/recognition to ensure institutional oversight by an external agency. Regarding CODA's USDE recognition, it was noted there would be no concern in modifying the Standards with regard to institutional accreditation/recognition.

It was also noted that in five (5) of the 14 advanced dental education programs within the Commission's purview, the Standards permit the program's sponsor to be an educational institution, hospital, or health care organization (with/without affiliation with an accredited hospital, as specified in the Standards). In the remaining nine (9) advanced dental education disciplines, the sponsor must be an educational institution or hospital. All standards permit United States military programs to sponsor advanced dental education programs, as specified in the Standards.

The Ad Hoc Committee discussed the issue of institutional sponsor given current Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA) grant opportunities for health care organizations that may sponsor advanced dental education programs. The Ad Hoc Committee discussed the term "health care organization" at length, including the type of entity that may be classified within this category and whether a definition of health care organization should be included in the CODA Standards. The Committee believed that a definition should be included in the Commission's Definition of Terms, to ensure clarity and transparency in the type of organization that is permitted to sponsor an advanced dental education program, for those standards that currently include the term "health care organization" and those where the term may be adopted and implemented at a future date.

While discussing health care organizations that may sponsor advanced dental education programs, there continued to be discussion and concern that these sponsors have appropriate educational validity and expertise to carry out an academic program at the postdoctoral level. The Ad Hoc Committee considered whether all health care organizations should also have an affiliation with an academic institution to ensure educational quality. In discussion, it was noted that affiliations may exist (absent a need for co-sponsorship); however, many health care organizations currently offering CODA-accredited advanced dental education programs are not directly affiliated with academic institutions.

The Ad Hoc Committee determined that a definition of "Health Care Organization" and potential inclusion of "health care organization" as an acceptable sponsoring institution warrant further input from the Commission's Review Committees to provide comment on the potential definition and inclusion of this term within their discipline-specific standards.

Following consideration of the Ad Hoc Committee's recommendation, the Commission directed the proposed Definition of Terms for Health Care Organization and proposed revision to Standards related to institutional sponsors to include health care organizations be circulated to all Review Committees in Advanced Dental Education for consideration at the Summer 2023 Commission meetings, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023. The Review Committees should provide comment on the potential definition and inclusion of this term within their discipline-specific standards.

Charter/License to Operate and Offer Instruction: The Ad Hoc Committee also considered the current language in nine (9) advanced dental education programs' Accreditation Standards, which states: *“Advanced dental education programs **must** be sponsored by institutions, which are properly chartered, and licensed to operate and offer instruction leading to degrees, diplomas or certificates with recognized education validity.”*

The Committee noted that the advanced dental education Standards for advanced education in general dentistry, dental anesthesiology, general practice residency, oral medicine, and orofacial pain do not currently include this requirement or an equivalent Standard. These five (5) disciplines recently reviewed their Accreditation Standards documents and tabled the discussion regarding inclusion of this requirement pending final recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee and the Commission.

Through discussion, the Ad Hoc Committee noted that words such as “chartered,” “licensed,” and “validity” have very distinct legal meanings. The term “authorization” is often used in higher education to indicate that an institution can confer a degree. Chartering and licensing often have to do with legal entities and do not necessarily indicate authority to award a degree, diploma or certificate with recognized education validity. The Ad Hoc Committee also noted the confusion related to this requirement from both the institution's/program's perspective and that of the CODA site visitor.

The Ad Hoc Committee believed the intent of this Standard is to ensure educational validity, which in dental education is granted through the accreditation process undertaken by the Commission on Dental Accreditation. Additionally, the conferring of a degree is mandated through institutional accreditation, while conferring of a post-doctoral certificate or diploma is a state or federal function.

Following lengthy discussion, the Ad Hoc Committee concluded that the intent of the requirement is to ensure that the sponsoring organization has the appropriate authority to operate and, as applicable, the necessary approvals to award either a certificate or a degree. As such, the Ad Hoc Committee believed that the prior requirement should be stricken from all advanced dental education Standards and replaced with a new requirement, which states (underline indicates addition): Advanced dental education programs conferring a certificate **must** have state or federal approval to operate and, as applicable, to confer a certificate. Advanced dental education programs conferring a degree **must** have institutional accreditation and authority to

confer a degree. The Committee noted that an advanced dental education program conferring a certificate must have state or federal approval to operate and, if needed based on its specific jurisdiction (i.e., state or federal regulations), it may also need approval to award a certificate. Likewise, an advanced dental education program awarding a degree will be required to show institutional accreditation providing it the authority to do so.

Following discussions at two (2) meetings, the Ad Hoc Committee recommended circulation of the proposed Definition of Terms for Health Care Organization and proposed revision to Standards related to institutional sponsors to include health care organizations and the proposed revision related to chartering and licensure (**Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 1501**) be circulated to all Review Committees in Advanced Dental Education for consideration at the Summer 2023 Commission meetings, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023. The Committee also noted that a Review Committee's recommendation to revise the Standards would require a period of public comment and further consideration at a future Commission meeting, following the Commission's consideration in Summer 2023.

At its Winter 2023 meeting, the Commission concurred with the Ad Hoc Committee's recommendations and directed all advanced dental education Review Committees to consider the proposed revisions to advanced dental education Standards found in (**Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 1501**), related to sponsoring organization and authority to operate, for possible adoption and implementation, with a report to the Commission in Summer 2023.

Summer 2023 Review Committee Meeting: At this meeting, the DENTANES RC discussed the proposed revisions as directed by the Commission and noted they include a proposed Definition of Terms for Health Care Organization, as well as the addition of requirements related to authority to operate, confer a certificate and, as applicable, confer a degree.

The DENTANES RC agreed that the proposed revisions provide further clarification of the types of institutions that may sponsor advanced dental education programs and requirements related to the authority to operate. Further, the DENTANES RC believed that the inclusion of the proposed definition and revisions in the Dental Anesthesiology Accreditation Standards should have no impact on dental anesthesiology education programs. The DENTANES RC also believed circulation of the proposed revisions to the communities of interest to provide the opportunity for review and comment is warranted.

Recommendation: It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation direct circulation of the proposed revisions found in **Appendix 1**, to the communities of interest for review and comment for one (1) year, with Hearings conducted in conjunction with the October 2023 American Dental Association (ADA) Annual Meeting and the March 2024 American Dental Education Association (ADEA) Annual Session with comments reviewed by the Review Committee and Commission at its Summer 2024 meetings.

**CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATING TO
MORE THAN ONE REVIEW COMMITTEE**

Matters related to more than one review committee are included in a separate report.

**CONSIDERATION OF SITE VISITOR APPOINTMENTS TO THE
COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION IN THE AREA OF DENTAL
ANESTHESIOLOGY EDUCATION**

Due to an ongoing need for additional site visitors, the Review Committee on Dental Anesthesiology Education (DENTANES RC) considered site visitor nominations at this meeting. The Committee's recommendations on the nominations are included in a separate report.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO ACCREDITATION STATUS

Matters related to accreditation status of programs are included in a separate report.

Respectfully submitted,

Dr. Joseph Giovannitti
Chair, Review Committee on Dental Anesthesiology Education

Commission on Dental Accreditation

Proposed Revisions to Definition of Terms and Standard 1-1

Additions are Underlined
~~Strikethroughs~~ indicate Deletions

Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Dental Anesthesiology

1
2 **PROPOSED REVISIONS TO ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED**
3 **DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS RELATED TO SPONSORING INSTITUTION**
4 **AND AUTHORITY TO OPERATE**
5
6

7 Additions are underlined; Deletions are ~~stricken~~
8

9 **PROPOSED REVISIONS FOR ALL ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION**
10 **STANDARDS:**
11

12 **Definition of Terms:**
13

14 **Health Care Organization:** A Federally Qualified Health Center (FQHC), Indian Health
15 Service (IHS), Veterans Health Administration system (VA), or academic health center/medical
16 center/ambulatory care center (both public and private) that is accredited by an agency
17 recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation
18 organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS).
19

1
2 **PROPOSED REVISIONS FOR STANDARD 1-1 FOR GENERAL PRACTICE**
3 **RESIDENCY AND DENTAL ANESTHESIOLOGY:**
4

5 The program **must** be sponsored or co-sponsored by either a United States-based hospital, or
6 educational institution or health care organization that is affiliated with an accredited hospital.
7 Each sponsoring and co-sponsoring institution **must** be accredited by an agency recognized by
8 the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization
9 recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS).

10
11 United States military programs not sponsored or co-sponsored by military medical treatment
12 facilities, United States-based educational institutions, hospitals or health care organizations
13 accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited
14 by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services
15 (CMS) **must** demonstrate successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection
16 criteria.

17
18 **Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:**

- 19 • Accreditation certificate or current official listing of accredited institutions from a United
20 States Department of Education recognized accreditation organization
21 • Evidence of successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection criteria
22 • Accreditation certificate or current official listing of accredited institution from an
23 accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services
24 (CMS). For example: Accreditation Association for Ambulatory Health Care (AAAHC);
25 Accreditation Commission for Health Care, Inc. (ACHC); American Association for
26 Accreditation of Ambulatory Surgery Facilities (AAAASF); American Osteopathic
27 Association Healthcare Facilities Accreditation Program (AOA/HFAP); Center for
28 Improvement in Healthcare Quality (CIHQ); Community Health Accreditation Program
29 (CHAP); DNV GL-Healthcare (DNV GL); National Dialysis Accreditation Commission
30 (NDAC); The Compliance Team (TCT); The Joint Commission (JC).

31
32 Advanced dental education programs conferring a certificate **must** have state or federal approval
33 to operate and, as applicable, to confer a certificate. Advanced dental education programs
34 conferring a degree **must** have institutional accreditation and authority to confer a degree.
35

36 **Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:**

- 37 • State license or federal authority documenting the institution's approval to operate and
38 confer a credential
39 • Institutional accreditation indicating approval to confer a degree
40