

REPORT OF THE REVIEW COMMITTEE ON ORTHODONTICS AND DENTOFACIAL ORTHOPEDICS EDUCATION TO THE COMMISSION ON DENTAL ACCREDITATION

Committee Chair: Dr. Glenn Sameshima. Committee Members: Dr. Sarandeep Huja, Dr. Howard Lieb, Dr. Juan Palomo, Ms. Marty Nicholson, and Dr. Emile Rossouw. Guests (Open Session Only, Virtual): Dr. Sheila Brear, chief learning officer, American Dental Education Association (ADEA), and Ms. Michelle Ritterskamp, continuing education senior specialist, American Association of Orthodontists (AAO), attended the policy portion of the meeting. Commission Staff: Dr. Yesenia Ruiz, manager, Advanced Dental Education, Ms. Peggy Soeldner, manager, Advanced Dental Education, Dr. Sherin Tooks, senior director, and Ms. Shelby Burgus, senior project assistant, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). The meeting of the Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education (ORTHO RC) was held on July 12, 2024, via a virtual meeting.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO ORTHODONTICS AND DENTOFACIAL ORTHOPEDICS EDUCATION

Informational Report on Frequency of Citings of Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics (p.1100): The Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education (ORTHO RC) considered the annual report on the frequency of citings of Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics implemented on July 1, 2022. Since that date, eighteen (18) site visits have been conducted by visiting committees of the Commission utilizing the July 2022 Standards. The ORTHO RC noted that Standard 2-9 related to the faculty to student ratio in the entire program was the most frequently cited requirement, with three (3) citings. The Standards with two (2) citings each are Standard 2, which requires the program director to maintain documentation of program activities, and Standard 3-6, which requires clinical facilities be provided within the sponsoring institution or affiliated institution. There were no (0) citings in Standard 4 Curriculum and Program Duration, Standard 5 Advanced Dental Education Students/Residents, and Standard 6 Research. Due to the small number of citings, sixteen total, no further analysis can be made at this time.

Recommendation: This report is informational in nature, and no action is required.

Informational Report on Frequency of Citings of Accreditation Standards for Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics (p. 1101): The Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education (ORTHO RC) considered the annual report on the frequency of citings of Accreditation Standards for Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics implemented August 7, 2015. Nine (9) site visits have been conducted by visiting committees of the Commission utilizing the August 2015 Standards. The ORTHO RC noted that there were no (0) citings during the period covered by this report.

Subsequent to the meeting, the Review Committee learned that, due to an error, the Frequency of Citings report found in **Appendix 1, Policy Report p. 1101** included information from both the prior and current Accreditation Standards within a single appendix. The ORTHO RC was informed that the citings report has been updated to reflect the termination of the August 7, 2015 Standards and the adoption and implementation of the January 1, 2023 Standards as a result of the most recent Validity and Reliability Study. Therefore, **Appendix 1** concludes the Frequency of Citings for the August 7, 2015 Accreditation Standards for Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics. There were seven (7) craniofacial and special orthodontics site visits from August 7, 2015 through December 31, 2022 as noted in **Appendix 1**. The report on the Frequency of Citings for the Accreditation Standards for Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics implemented January 1, 2023 is found in **Appendix 2**. There have been two (2) craniofacial and special orthodontics site visits conducted from January 1, 2023 through October 31, 2023 as noted in **Appendix 2**. To ensure confidentiality, Frequency of Citings reports will not be made available where a limited number (three or less) of programs have been site visited. The Commission will continue to receive reports annually summarizing the updated data on the frequency of citings of individual Standards.

Recommendation: This report is informational in nature and no action is required.

Consideration of Proposed Revision to Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs Related to Sponsoring Organization and Authority to Operate (p.

1102): At its Winter 2022 meeting, the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA) directed the formation of an Ad Hoc Committee of all advanced dental education Commissioners to consider the changing landscape of health care delivery centers that may sponsor advanced dental education programs. The Ad Hoc Committee, which met on December 5, 2022 and January 25, 2023, was charged with two (2) primary considerations: 1) the topic of institutional sponsor, whether a sponsor is an academic institution, hospital, or health care organization, and 2) review of the standard found in some advanced dental education disciplines that requires the sponsor to have proper chartering/licensure to operate and offer instruction leading to a degree, diploma or certificate with recognized education validity. A summary of the work of the Ad Hoc Committee and Summer 2023 Review Committee and Commission review is found in **Policy Report p. 1102**.

At its Summer 2024 meeting, the Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics (ORTHO RC) considered the proposed revision to the Accreditation Standards related to the Definition of Terms for Health Care Organization and to chartering and licensure to operate (**Appendices 1 and 2, Policy Report p. 1102**). The Review Committee also considered all comments received by the Commission prior to the June 1, 2024 deadline (**Appendix 3, Policy Report p. 1102**). The Review Committee noted that the Commission received no (0) comments at the virtual hearing in conjunction with the 2023 ADA Annual Meeting. The Commission received no (0) comments at the virtual hearing in conjunction with the 2024 ADEA Annual Session. The Commission office received two (2) written comments prior to the June 1, 2024 deadline.

The Review Committee noted that federal funding resources are available to programs in other advanced dental education areas (i.e., general dentistry and pediatric dentistry), which would benefit from the proposed revision. The Review Committee also considered potential revisions developed by Commission staff, provided at the meeting, to address the general concerns expressed among all comments received for the advanced dental education Standards. The comments received indicated that additional organizations may fulfill the requirement for an institutional accreditor (e.g., Health Resources and Services Administration Operational Site Visit), and there is a need to further clarify the method by which a program demonstrates its authority to operate and authority to confer a certificate and/or degree.

Following consideration, the Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education believed that the proposed Standards found in **Appendix 3 (Residency)** and **Appendix 4 (Fellowship)**, which include additional wording to address the general comments received by CODA, should be implemented immediately and all related Commission documents be updated accordingly. The Review Committee did not believe that circulation of the revision was warranted since the additional revisions further clarified the intent of the Standards.

Recommendations: It is recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation adopt the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics related to the Definition of Terms for Health Care Organization and to chartering and licensure to operate (**Appendix 3**) and direct revision of all related documents, with immediate implementation.

It is further recommended that the Commission on Dental Accreditation adopt the proposed revisions to the Accreditation Standards for Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics related to the Definition of Terms for Health Care Organization and to chartering and licensure to operate (**Appendix 4**) and direct revision of all related documents, with immediate implementation.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATING TO MORE THAN ONE REVIEW COMMITTEE

Matters related to more than one review committee are included in a separate report.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATED TO ACCREDITATION STATUS

Matters related to accreditation status of programs are included in a separate report.

Respectfully submitted,

Dr. Glenn Sameshima
Chair, Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education

**CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS RELATING TO
MORE THAN ONE REVIEW COMMITTEE**

Informational Report on Review Committee and Commission Meeting Dates (p. 1800):

The Review Committee on Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics Education (ORTHO RC) reviewed the Commission's scheduled meeting dates for 2024 through 2025.

Recommendation: This report is informational in nature, and no action is required.

**ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR CLINICAL FELLOWSHIP TRAINING
PROGRAMS IN CRANIOFACIAL AND SPECIAL CARE ORTHODONTICS**

Frequency of Citings Based on Required Areas of Compliance

Total Number Programs Evaluated: 7
August 7, 2015 through December 31, 2022

STANDARD 1 – INSTITUTIONAL COMMITMENT/PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS –
22 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 2 – PROGRAM DIRECTOR AND TEACHING STAFF – 14 Required
Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 3 – FACILITIES AND RESOURCES – 17 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 4 – CURRICULUM AND PROGRAM DURATION – 14 Required Areas
of Compliance

STANDARD 5 –STUDENTS/FELLOWS– 9 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 6 – FELLOWSHIP PROGRAMS – 13 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 7 – RESEARCH – 1 Required Area of Compliance

**ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR CLINICAL FELLOWSHIP TRAINING
PROGRAMS IN CRANIOFACIAL AND SPECIAL CARE ORTHODONTICS**

Frequency of Citings Based on Required Areas of Compliance

Total Number Programs Evaluated: 2
January 1, 2023 through October 31, 2023

To ensure confidentiality, Frequency of Citings reports will not be made available where a limited number (three or less) of programs have been site visited.

STANDARD 1 – INSTITUTIONAL COMMITMENT/PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS –
27 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 2 – PROGRAM DIRECTOR AND TEACHING STAFF – 19 Required
Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 3 – FACILITIES AND RESOURCES – 17 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 4 – CURRICULUM AND PROGRAM DURATION – 15 Required Areas
of Compliance

STANDARD 5 –STUDENTS/FELLOWS– 10 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 6 – FELLOWSHIP PROGRAMS – 15 Required Areas of Compliance

STANDARD 7 – RESEARCH – 1 Required Area of Compliance

Commission on Dental Accreditation

At its Summer 2023 meeting, the Commission directed that the proposed revisions to Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics (Residency) be distributed to the appropriate communities of interest for review and comment, with comment due June 1, 2024, for review at the Summer 2024 Commission meeting.

This document represents the proposed revisions based upon review of comment received from communities of interest from August 11, 2023 to June 1, 2024.

This document will be considered by the Commission in Summer 2024.

Revisions in RED, circulated August 11, 2023 to June 1, 2024

Revisions in GREEN, additions following consideration by the Review Committee in Summer 2024

Additions are Underlined;
~~Strikethroughs~~ indicate Deletions

Accreditation Standards for Advanced Dental Education Programs in Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics (Residency)

**PROPOSED REVISIONS TO ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED
DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS RELATED TO SPONSORING INSTITUTION
AND AUTHORITY TO OPERATE**

Additions are underlined; Deletions are ~~stricken~~

**PROPOSED REVISIONS FOR ALL ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION
STANDARDS:**

Definition of Terms:

Health Care Organization: A Federally Qualified Health Center (FQHC), Indian Health Service (IHS), Veterans Health Administration system (VA), or academic health center/medical center/ambulatory care center (both public and private) that is accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS).

PROPOSED REVISIONS FOR STANDARD 1 FOR DENTAL PUBLIC HEALTH, ENDODONTICS, ORAL AND MAXILLOFACIAL PATHOLOGY, ORAL AND MAXILLOFACIAL RADIOLOGY, ORTHODONTICS AND DENTOFACIAL ORTHOPEDICS (RESIDENCY), ORAL AND MAXILLOFACIAL SURGERY (RESIDENCY), PEDIATRIC DENTISTRY, PERIODONTICS, AND PROSTHODONTICS:

Standard 1-Institutional Commitment/Program Effectiveness

~~Advanced dental education programs must be sponsored by institutions, which are properly chartered, and licensed to operate and offer instruction leading to degrees, diplomas or certificates with recognized education validity.~~ Hospitals that sponsor advanced dental education programs **must** be accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). Educational institutions that sponsor advanced dental education programs **must** be accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education. Health care organizations that sponsor advanced dental education programs must be accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS) or receive regular on-site inspections through the Health Resources and Services Administration Operational Site Visit (HRSA-OSV) process. The bylaws, rules and regulations of hospitals or health care organizations that sponsor or provide a substantial portion of advanced dental education programs **must** assure that dentists are eligible for medical staff membership and privileges including the right to vote, hold office, serve on medical staff committees and admit, manage and discharge patients.

United States military programs not sponsored or co-sponsored by military medical treatment facilities, United States-based educational institutions, hospitals or health care organizations accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS) **must** demonstrate successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection criteria.

Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:

- Accreditation certificate or current official listing of accredited institutions from a United States Department of Education recognized accreditation organization
- Evidence of successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection criteria
- Accreditation certificate or current official listing of accredited institution from an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). For example: Accreditation Association for Ambulatory Health Care (AAAHC); Accreditation Commission for Health Care, Inc. (ACHC); American Association for Accreditation of Ambulatory Surgery Facilities (AAAASF); American Osteopathic Association Healthcare Facilities Accreditation Program (AOA/HFAP); Center for Improvement in Healthcare Quality (CIHQ); Community Health Accreditation Program (CHAP); DNV GL-Healthcare (DNV GL); National Dialysis Accreditation Commission

- (NDAC); The Compliance Team (TCT); The Joint Commission (JC).

Advanced dental education programs conferring a certificate **must** have state or federal approval to operate and, as applicable, to confer a certificate. Advanced dental education programs conferring a degree **must** have institutional accreditation and authority to confer a degree.

Intent: The educational program demonstrates either: a) documentation of receipt of federal aid as evidence to operate, or b) documentation of a state business license as evidence to operate. Additionally, as required by the state, the program demonstrates authority through an appropriate state agency when issuing a certificate of completion. If conferring a degree, the program demonstrates authorization from its institutional accrediting agency.

Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:

- State license or federal authority documenting the institution's approval to operate and confer a credential
- Institutional accreditation indicating approval to confer a degree

Commission on Dental Accreditation

At its Summer 2023 meeting, the Commission directed that the proposed revisions to Accreditation Standards for Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics be distributed to the appropriate communities of interest for review and comment, with comment due June 1, 2024, for review at the Summer 2024 Commission meeting.

This document represents the proposed revisions based upon review of comment received from communities of interest from August 11, 2023 to June 1, 2024.

This document will be considered by the Commission in Summer 2024.

Revisions in RED, circulated August 11, 2023 to June 1, 2024

Revisions in GREEN, additions following consideration by the Review Committee in Summer 2024

Accreditation Standards for Clinical Fellowship Training Programs in Craniofacial and Special Care Orthodontics

**PROPOSED REVISIONS TO ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR ADVANCED
DENTAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS RELATED TO SPONSORING INSTITUTION
AND AUTHORITY TO OPERATE**

Additions are underlined; Deletions are ~~stricken~~

**PROPOSED REVISIONS FOR ALL ADVANCED DENTAL EDUCATION
STANDARDS:**

Definition of Terms:

Health Care Organization: A Federally Qualified Health Center (FQHC), Indian Health Service (IHS), Veterans Health Administration system (VA), or academic health center/medical center/ambulatory care center (both public and private) that is accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS).

PROPOSED REVISIONS FOR STANDARD 1 CLINICAL FELLOWSHIP TRAINING PROGRAMS IN CRANIOFACIAL AND SPECIAL CARE ORTHODONTICS:

Standard 1-Institutional Commitment/Program Effectiveness

Hospitals that sponsor fellowships **must** be accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). Educational institutions that sponsor fellowships **must** be accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education. Health care organizations that sponsor advanced dental education programs **must** be accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS) or receive regular on-site inspections through the Health Resources and Services Administration Operational Site Visit (HRSA-OSV) process. The bylaws, rules and regulations of hospitals or health care organizations that sponsor or provide a substantial portion of fellowship programs **must** assure that dentists are eligible for medical staff membership and privileges including the right to vote, hold office, serve on medical staff committees and admit, manage and discharge patients.

United States military programs not sponsored or co-sponsored by military medical treatment facilities, United States-based educational institutions, hospitals or health care organizations accredited by an agency recognized by the United States Department of Education or accredited by an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS) **must** demonstrate successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection criteria.

Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:

- Accreditation certificate or current official listing of accredited institutions from a United States Department of Education recognized accreditation organization
- Evidence of successful achievement of Service-specific organizational inspection criteria
- Accreditation certificate or current official listing of accredited institution from an accreditation organization recognized by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). For example: Accreditation Association for Ambulatory Health Care (AAAHC); Accreditation Commission for Health Care, Inc. (ACHC); American Association for Accreditation of Ambulatory Surgery Facilities (AAAASF); American Osteopathic Association Healthcare Facilities Accreditation Program (AOA/HFAP); Center for Improvement in Healthcare Quality (CIHQ); Community Health Accreditation Program (CHAP); DNV GL-Healthcare (DNV GL); National Dialysis Accreditation Commission (NDAC); The Compliance Team (TCT); The Joint Commission (JC).

Advanced dental education programs conferring a certificate **must** have state or federal approval to operate and, as applicable, to confer a certificate. Advanced dental education programs conferring a degree **must** have institutional accreditation and authority to confer a degree.

Intent: The educational program demonstrates either: a) documentation of receipt of federal aid as evidence to operate, or b) documentation of a state business license as evidence to operate. Additionally, as required by the state, the program demonstrates authority through an appropriate

state agency when issuing a certificate of completion. If conferring a degree, the program demonstrates authorization from its institutional accrediting agency.

Examples of evidence to demonstrate compliance may include:

- State license or federal authority documenting the institution's approval to operate and confer a credential
- Institutional accreditation indicating approval to confer a degree